Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission July 11, 2024 at 7:30PM – Meeting Minutes

Roll Call

Present: Acting Chair Amy Peterson and Commissioners David Bates, Scot Mazur, Jessica Paul,

Paul Ribera, Ron Roman, and Mark Weiner

Absent: Commissioner Asha Andriana and Chair Lou Garapolo Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

Motion by Commissioner Roman to appoint Commissioner Peterson to Acting Chair. Second by Commissioner Mazur. Motion approved 7-0.

Agenda Approval

Acting Chair Peterson said they would move the last item, 163 N Euclid Ave, to first on the agenda.

Motion by Commissioner Roman to approve the agenda. Second by Commissioner Bates. Motion approved 7-0.

Non-Agenda Public Comment

None

Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Bates to approve the minutes from June 13, 2024. Second by Commissioner Paul. Motion approved 7-0.

Regular Agenda

A. Advisory Review: 163 N Euclid Ave (Pearson): Advisory Review for proposed new garage on the site of previous, non-historic garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Peterson introduced the item. Planner Trexler provided a summary. She read Chair Garapolo's written comments; he stated that he agreed with the staff report.

Kim Smith, the architect, was present. She said they want a new garage. It will be brick with a hip roof. She asked about the recommendations and Planner Trexler said she suggested windows on the side elevation. Commissioner Weiner suggested adding a mullion per the staff report. Ms. Smith agreed.

Commissioner Roman asked if the garage is currently a 2-car garage. Ms. Smith confirmed and said it will be almost exactly the same size. Commissioner Roman asked about the windows facing the house. Ms. Smith said there are two and they will change them to be double-hung windows to match the house.

B. HPC2024-14: 150 N Cuyler Ave (Scott Cunningham & Christina Frigo): Certificate of Appropriateness to remove historic stucco siding from house and porch, and restore original wood siding and porch details including balusters and columns (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Acting Chair Peterson introduced the item. Planner Trexler provided a summary. She said the addition of stucco represents the trend to add Prairie style elements to older houses. She said this project was reviewed by the Architectural Review Committee and they were favorable but recommended additional research be done. The homeowner found a connected, similar house in River Forest and is proposing the replicate the measurements of their railings. She said the owner wants to move forward quickly with the project and does not yet have drawings. However, if the Commission finds the project appropriate, they may approve the COA with the condition that final drawings be reviewed and approved by staff.

Planner Trexler read Chair Garapolo's written comments. He wrote that he recommended restoration back to the original condition. He said he agrees with ARC commends to have staff review elevations to ensure compliance with researched information.

Scott Cunningham, the homeowner, was present. He explained some of the historical research, including that the architect built a similar house in River Forest a few years later. They measured the railing details and the height is the same as their current railing.

Motion by Commissioner Weiner to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Mazur.

Commissioner Roman asked if they would be able to restore the wood under the stucco. Mr. Cunningham said it may be in poor shape so they might need to replace it. Acting Chair Peterson asked it they would replace with wood to match and Mr. Cunningham confirmed. Acting Chair Peterson asked if the balustrade is still under the knee wall. Mr. Cunningham said it's possible.

Commissioner Roman asked about the railing height. Planner Trexler explained that there is a building code exception in the historic districts that allows homeowners to retain the historic railing height if they wish to.

Commissioner Weiner said everything will go back to the original appearance and he commends that. Commissioner Roman asked what's on the second floor and if there's a balcony. Mr. Cunningham said that's a 1925 photo. The house had a renovation between 1917 and 1920, and they think the balcony was added at that time. It was removed at some point a while ago.

Commissioner Weiner made a motion to approve the project as proposed with the condition that staff provide a final review of the elevations to confirm it matches what was described. Second by Commissioner Mazur. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Bates, Commissioner Mazur, Commissioner Paul, Commissioner Ribera, Commissioner Roman, Commissioner Weiner, and Acting Chair Peterson

NAY: None

- C. 614 N Ridgeland Ave (Jeffrey & Heather Nelson), Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District:
 - a. **HPC2024-15:** Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish historic garage

Acting Chair Peterson introduced the item. Planner Trexler provided a summary. She said this was previously approved by the HPC in 2023 but a COA is only valid for one year. The applicant is asking for an updated COA. She read the comments from Chair Garapolo, which stated that the HPC previously approved this project and he agrees with staff.

Heather Nelson, the homeowner, was present. She said they didn't realize the COA would expire. Nothing has changed since the previous review. They're going to replace the 1-car garage with a 2-car garage.

Motion by Commissioner Paul to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Mazur.

Commissioner Weiner said there's nothing to add. Commissioner Paul said this seems straight forward. Commissioner Roman agreed and said he has no questions.

Motion by Commissioner Roman to approve the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Bates. Motion approved 7-0.

b. Advisory Review: Proposed new, 2-car garage

Acting Chair Peterson introduced the item. Planner Trexler provided a summary. She read Chair Garapolo's comments which said the garage should be compatible with the style of the house including the profile of the roof. The window and door trim should be similar.

Ms. Nelson, the homeowner, was present for the project.

Commissioner Weiner recommended against vinyl siding. He said it may be noticeable from the street and it would be great if it could match the house. Ms. Nelson said they are discussing alternate materials with their contractor. They're looking at a material that is not Hardie board but is similar.

Commissioner Peterson said the house has some trim details, like on the corners of the house. It would be nice to see these on the garage. They would help tie it to the house. Ms. Nelson agreed to look into this.

Other Business

Planner Trexler said the Historic Preservation award selection is coming up this fall and encouraged Commissioners to nominate properties. She said they do not have to be in historic districts. They can send nomination addresses to historic preservation staff.

Planner Trexler introduced new Commissioner Paul Ribera and gave an update on available seats on the Commission. The Commission did a round of introductions.

ADJOURN

Motion by Commissioner Weiner to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Mazur.

The meeting adjourned at 8:10PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.