

**Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
December 14, 2023 at 7:30PM – Meeting Minutes**

Roll Call

Present: Chair Lou Garapolo and Commissioners Asha Andriana, David Bates, Monique Chase, Scot Mazur, and Amy Peterson
Absent: Commissioner Mark Weiner
Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

Agenda Approval

Motion by Commissioner Peterson to approve the agenda. Second by Commissioner Mazur. Motion approved 6-0.

Planner Trexler said that 435 N Elmwood Ave was incorrectly listed on the agenda as in the Gunderson Historic District. It is in the Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District.

Non-Agenda Public Comment

None

Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Andriana to approve the minutes for November 30, 2023. Second by Commissioner Bates. Motion approved 6-0.

Regular Agenda

- A. Advisory Review: 734 N Oak Park Ave (Margaret & Chris Marzec):** Advisory Review of screened porch addition at rear of house to replace existing non-historic porch (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Garapolo introduced the item and Planner Trexler provided an overview. She said the existing rear porch was built in 1992 and is not historic. As no historic materials will be demolished, a Certificate of Appropriateness is not required. However, due to the increased visibility of the new enclosed porch, Advisory Review was recommended.

Present on behalf of the project were Chris Bremer, the architect, and Maggie Kelly, the homeowner. Mr. Bremer said the current porch is small and 30 years old. It is falling apart. Rather than repair, they wanted to start with a clean slate and make it larger. It will have a hip roof and a fireplace. The fireplace won't be visible as it will be located behind the house.

Chair Garapolo asked about the window headers and said they don't align with the front porch. Mr. Bremer said the intent was to line them up. Commissioner Chase asked if the brick on the chimney will match the house and Ms. Kelly confirmed.

Chair Garapolo asked about the sills on the new windows. Ms. Kelly explained that the sills on the house are concrete. Chair Garapolo recommended using wider trim to better match the size of the historic sills.

Commissioner Peterson said the proposal is much more congruent with the house than the existing porch.

- B. HPC2023-46: 232 N Taylor Ave (Bianca Sola & Ty Perkins):** Certificate of Appropriateness for two added dormers to accommodate attic renovation for house on corner lot (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Garapolo introduced the item and Planner Trexler provided an overview. She said the additional dormers will match the materials of the existing dormers and will be less than 50% of the roof plane as required by the Guidelines.

Kim Smith, the architect, was present for the project. She said there's a lot of space in the attic but it's not very tall. She explained that she broke up the side dormer into three parts so it's more congruous. The existing dormers are lap wood, but they're up for discussion on whether stucco would be appropriate. They tried to match the mullions on the top sash of historic windows.

Motion by Commissioner Chase to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Mazur.

Commissioner Peterson asked if the existing dormers are original and Ms. Smith said they are. Commissioner Peterson asked if they were always wood clad. Ms. Smith said as far as we know. She said she originally drew the new dormers with stucco and she thinks that would look great. Commissioner Peterson said she's fine either way, whatever the original material is.

Commissioner Chase asked if a wood clapboard is proposed and Ms. Smith confirmed. Chair Garapolo said wood lap siding makes sense. He asked if the roofing material will match and Ms. Smith confirmed.

Commissioner Chase said it's a thoughtful way to add a dormer without overwhelming the whole roof. Chair Garapolo said the solution makes sense.

Commissioner Andriana made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Peterson Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Bates, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Mazur, Commissioner Peterson, and Chair Garapolo

NAY: None

- C. HPC2023-47: 1021 Superior St (Kristina & Patrick Woodward):** Certificate of Appropriateness for restoration of historic porch extension and side addition of three-season room adjacent to porch (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Garapolo introduced the item and Planner Trexler provided an overview. She explained that the porch originally had side extensions on both sides with round edges, which are visible on the Sanborn map. This house was originally located on the current site of the Nathan G. Moore house. Nathan Moore moved it several lots over. One side extension of the porch was retained with the move. The homeowner wants to restore the porch, which currently appears to have been vastly

altered or replaced in the 1980s. They will also build a side addition behind the porch, which will be a 3-season room.

Kim Smith, the architect, was present for the project. She said the homeowners have been restoring the house for years and have been very sensitive. They love the idea of bringing back the curved end of the porch. The back portion, with the columns, will read like a porch but will be a three-season room. She said they are open to comments.

Motion by Commissioner Andriana to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Chase.

Commissioner Peterson asked about the foundation. Ms. Smith confirmed the house foundation is stone and they will use stone piers with slats between for the porch and addition. The slats will be square wood. Commissioner Peterson asked if the siding on the 3-season room will match the house and Ms. Smith confirmed that it will be wood lap.

Commissioner Peterson asked Ms. Smith to talk about the windows. Ms. Smith said she liked this proportion best. Moving up the sills made them look squat.

The Commission discussed the handling of the columns. Chair Garapolo wanted to make sure the columns were expressed and Ms. Smith clarified that the columns on the 3-season room will be half columns so will have the appearance of whole columns from the exterior while not limiting space on the interior.

Chair Garapolo noted the differences between the historic windows on the front elevation and the new windows on the 3-season room. The Commission discussed various alternatives and Ms. Smith explained her reasoning. Chair Garapolo recommended looking at a higher central sash line to align with the historic windows but said it wouldn't make it a condition of approval. The Commission agreed.

Commissioner Andriana said this is a really good proposal and she approves of it. Chair Garapolo said it will really improve the look of the house.

Commissioner Peterson made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Chase. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Bates, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Mazur, Commissioner Peterson, and Chair Garapolo

NAY: None

- D. HPC2023-48: 435 N Elmwood Ave (Julie & Glen Frybarger):** Certificate of Appropriateness for rear and side addition for building on a corner lot (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Garapolo introduced the item and Planner Trexler provided an overview. She confirmed with the architect that the windows will be clad wood.

Present on behalf of the project were Bill Scholtens, the architect, and Julie and Glen Frybarger, the homeowners. Mr. Scholtens described the project. He noted many of the historic details on the house, such as windows and trim treatments, that they picked up on for the addition. Ms. Frybarger said they are excited about the project. Mr. Frybarger said they live in North Carolina and are moving

back to Oak Park. He said his wife grew up in this house and they are excited to be doing this renovation. He said they're proud to be part of the historic district.

Motion by Commissioner Peterson to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Chase.

Commissioner Peterson asked for confirmation that the leaded glass windows will remain and Mr. Scholtens confirmed.

Chair Garapolo said the house is delightful and it's hard to see because of where the garage is located. He said the proportions of the addition are sensitive and it looks good.

Commissioner Peterson made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Andriana. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Bates, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Mazur, Commissioner Peterson, and Chair Garapolo

NAY: None

- E. HPC2023-49: 244 Forest Ave (Jim & Sally Prescott):** Certificate of Appropriateness for 2-story rear addition and 1-story side addition (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Garapolo introduced the item and Planner Trexler provided an overview. She explained that the side, one-story addition will be the most visible portion.

Present on behalf of the project were Jon Hague, the architect, and Jim Prescott, the homeowner. Mr. Hague said the homeowners have put a lot of effort into bringing this house back. The addition will be contextual with the house and has been scaled down to be proportional. Mr. Prescott said they did a lot of work on the house when they bought it 20 years ago. The previous family had been there 40 years and it needed an update. They are now finishing the job with the back of the house and the garage. He said when they researched the house, they found it was built in 1878 and is probably one of the oldest in the area. They're trying to be consistent with the work they did several years ago.

Motion by Commissioner Peterson to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Chase.

Commissioner Chase said as someone who volunteers with the Frank Lloyd Wright Trust, she thinks the bump out with the end blocked off fits in well with the Frank Lloyd Wright buildings and the rest of the street.

Chair Garapolo asked about the height of the addition, particularly as compared to the existing bay. The Commission discussed. Chair Garapolo recommended adding a piece of horizontal trim at the location of the trim on the bay to tie in that line. Mr. Hague agreed to explore that option.

Commissioner Peterson said she likes how the details are threaded through the whole project.

Commissioner Peterson made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Chase. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Bates, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Mazur, Commissioner Peterson, and Chair Garapolo

NAY: None

F. Advisory Review: 244 Forest Ave (Jim & Sally Prescott): Advisory Review for proposed new garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Garapolo introduced the item and Planner Trexler provided an overview. She said the existing garage is not considered visible from the street, but the proposed garage will have an increased footprint. Due to its increased visibility, Advisory Review was recommended.

Present on behalf of the project were Jon Hague, the architect, and Jim Prescott, the homeowner. Mr. Hague said they carried through the details on the house. There is a patio between the house and garage. The double window on the garage and the materials will match the house. It's a simple, 2-car garage. The existing garage needs repair so this is an opportunity to rebuild. Mr. Hague said the existing garage was built in 1941 and has outlived its usefulness.

Chair Garapolo asked for a description of issues with the current garage. Mr. Prescott said the foundation is cracked and heavy rain gathers and further damages the structure. There's a shed addition to the garage. The garage door is not original, the previous door wouldn't open anymore. The roof is starting to bow. Commissioner Andriana directed the Commission to page 6 of the report which illustrates the roof issues.

Chair Garapolo said they typically spend a lot of time discussing garages. He recommended taking some photos of the problems as part of the record. Commissioner Chase said the garage isn't visible, so they don't have purview over it. Chair Garapolo said as part of the record it would be helpful.

Chair Garapolo said it would help to have a painted wood band under the eave line, like on the house. Mr. Hague said they made some effort to match the kitchen window. They can certainly add that detail. Chair Garapolo said they did a good job with the windows and door.

G. HPC2023-50: 931 Chicago Ave (Frank Lloyd Wright Trust): Certificate of Appropriateness to remove non-original additions including non-historic additions on the front and rear and restoration façades in these locations (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Garapolo introduced the item and Planner Trexler provided an overview. Planner Trexler explained that the Frank Lloyd Wright Trust wishes to remove three additions, two of which are documented as not historic and one of which is likely historic. She said that the Secretary of the Interior's Standards state that, "most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved."

Present on behalf of the project were: Tom Bassett-Dilley and Mark Melvin from Tom Bassett-Dilley Architects, Doug Freerksen and Colby Shaft from contractor Von Dreele Freerksen Construction, and Carl Tredway from the Frank Lloyd Wright Trust. Mr. Bassett-Dilley said they want to bring the house more in line with what was there in the Frank Lloyd Wright era. The east side has seen a lot of changes over time. The east wing was added by Mr. Blair [prior to Frank Lloyd Wright] and had a one-story porch. The side porch in question came after 1920. He said on the front, they will restore the front window casing. There's an old window in the bathroom that might be the original window. They hope to move this back to the main wall. If not, they will restore with a painted wood window.

Mr. Bassett-Dilley said once they open the front wall and see what's there, they would like to restore it accurately. He described the construction of the side addition and said it was originally a porch, so it's a problem. Mr. Freerksen said it was likely an entry porch. It didn't have a foundation, siding, windows, or trim. Everything you see now is much more recent. It was probably added piece by piece. He pointed out the faux foundation line that goes around these additions and said he thinks it was added on as a way to keep the rodents out. Mr. Bassett-Dilley said it seems the work was done more for expedience. This house was rented out to boarders after Anna Lloyd Jones left.

Motion by Commissioner Chase to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Andriana.

Commissioner Peterson said the side addition appears to be on the 1930 Sanborn map. The Committee agreed. Chair Garapolo asked what it might have been and Mr. Freerksen said it was an entry porch. Commissioner Peterson said it looks like it was enclosed by 1930. The question then becomes if this is a historically important piece of the house.

Commissioner Chase said the Trust is looking for that specific Frank Lloyd Wright era. She asked if they are looking to add historical relevance or talk about it at all to the public. Mr. Bassett-Dilley said people don't come to see Anna's house. But if they know, they will. Commissioner Chase said she's more inclined to let it be removed, if the Trust will discuss the house. Mr. Freerksen said he's been told people do like to walk around this house. Right now, the east elevation is an embarrassment, in part because of this bump-out. Over 80,000 people per year visit the house, and that just counts the people who register. He said every time he's there, he's in awe that he gets to work at it. Mr. Freerksen said they'd very much like it to look like it did. Wright left this house pretty much alone. It was after his time that things got built.

Commissioner Peterson asked staff to confirm this is not a landmark. Planner Trexler confirmed and said it is a contributing building within the historic district.

Chair Garapolo said the work that has been done so far looks really good and he's in favor of this project. He said the addition doesn't really add anything. The other elements are a forgone conclusion and should be removed.

Commissioner Peterson said collectively bringing it back to the Wright era is really important and she's supportive of the project as well.

Commissioner Peterson made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Andriana. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Bates, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Mazur, Commissioner Peterson, and Chair Garapolo

NAY: None

OTHER BUSINESS

➤ Elect Acting Chair for the Historic Preservation Commission

Commissioner Peterson nominated Commissioner Andriana. Commissioner Andriana accepted the nomination.

Commissioner Peterson made a motion to elect Commissioner Andriana as Acting Chair. Second by Commissioner Chase. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Bates, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Mazur, Commissioner Peterson, and Chair Garapolo

NAY: None

➤ **Education: Discuss education work group**

Chair Garapolo said they have created a work group and have just started an outline of elements to discuss further. He said it is too preliminary right now, but they will share more. Former Commissioner David Sokol is assisting.

Commissioner Peterson said some of the things they are discussing include talking points for the Village Board and potential topics and media to use for residents, tourists, and board members.

Chair Garapolo mentioned the preservation awards program and Planner Trexler said the Village is working on a new date for January, which she will share.

Planner Trexler updated the Commission on the online historic resources map and said it will be available to the Commission and the general public in January.

ADJOURN

Motion by Commissioner Mazur to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Bates

The meeting adjourned at 9:10PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.