

**Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission  
October 14, 2021 – Meeting Minutes  
Remote Participation Meeting, 7:30 pm**

**Roll Call**

Present: Chair Noel Weidner and Commissioners Asha Andriana, Mo Chase, Sarah Doherty, Lou Garapolo, and David Sokol  
Absent: Commissioners Rebecca Houze, Nicole Napper, and Rachel Will  
Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

Trustee Robinson was in attendance.

**Agenda Approval**

*Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the agenda. Second by Commissioner Garapolo.  
Motion approved 6-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, and Chair Weidner*

*NAY: None*

**Non-Agenda Public Comment**

None

**Minutes**

Commission Garapolo requested an edit on page 2, paragraph 6, noting that it should refer to two contractors rather than buildings. Planner Trexler said this would be corrected.

*Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to approve the minutes for September 9, 2021. Second by Commissioner Doherty. Motion approved 6-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, and Chair Weidner*

*NAY: None*

**Regular Agenda**

**A. Advisory Review: 730 Belleforte Ave (Katie Zapata):** Advisory Review of new coach house (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. She said this project was reviewed by the Architectural Review Committee on August 26, 2021. As the existing garage was built in 1959, it is not considered historic and this review is Advisory only.

Katie Zapata, the homeowner, and Kim Smith, the architect, were present.

Commissioner Garapolo said the ARC had no comments and the design looks good. Commissioner Sokol said he has no problems. Chair Weidner asked if the windows are the same as the windows on the house and Ms. Smith confirmed. Commissioner Doherty asked if the garage will be larger than the current garage and Ms. Smith said it is just a bit larger. She said it is 1.5 stories, vs. the 2.5-story house so commensurate in size. Ms. Smith said the coach house will mimic the house with the gable roofs and dormers.

- B. HPC2021-44: 730 Belleforte Ave (Katie Zapata):** Certificate of Appropriateness to replace non-historic, second-floor addition on one-story bungalow and add a third, half-story addition (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. She said this project was reviewed by the Architectural Review Committee at their meeting on August 26, 2021. She said one of the main items discussed by the ARC was siding; the ARC recommended wood clapboard or stucco. A wood product like LP Smartside was noted as an appropriate alternative to wood. The applicant plans to use LP Smartside for the addition.

Katie Zapata, the homeowner, and Kim Smith, the architect, were present. Ms. Zapata said the impetus for the project was a mold issue from the gambrel roof. She said they are grateful for Kim's expertise in keeping with the look, feel, and history of Oak Park. Ms. Smith said they had a great discussion with the ARC in August. She explained some of the project details and responded to some of the comments brought up by the ARC.

*Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

Commissioner Garapolo said the project incorporates all the comments of the ARC. He said the LP siding on the second floor relates well to the proposed garage and this will be a much better neighbor on Belleforte than the current design. Commissioner Sokol expressed his approval of the proposal. Commissioner Weidner said he appreciates inclusion of photos of the neighbors for context. Commissioner Doherty asked if the garage will be all Smartside and Ms. Smith confirmed that it will.

Chair Weidner said he appreciates that they took the recommendations of the ARC. He asked about the relationship in height with the neighboring houses. Ms. Smith said it will be very similar in height to the neighboring house to the south.

*Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Doherty. Motion approved 6-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, and Chair Weidner*

*NAY: None*

- C. HPC2021-45: 838 Fair Oaks Ave (Daniel Urbi-McCarthy):** Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish existing garage and build a new garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Daniel Urbi-McCarthy, the homeowner, was present. He said the garage is severely deteriorated and they want to use this opportunity to build a garage that will better match the house. He said he understands the hesitancy over the Hardie board and they did find an LP hard-side type siding that would fit in with the cedar shake. He said the intent of the gable roof is to provide storage space but they are amenable to a hip roof. He said an electrical pole bisects the lot on the alley side, which makes the location of the garage tough.

*Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Doherty.*

Commissioner Garapolo agreed the garage is not in good condition. He recommended a hip roof and the LP siding described. He said the Commission usually requests deeper eaves and matching trim to correspond with the house. Mr. Urbi-McCarthy said in order to fit the garage, they have to make full use of the space between the electrical pole and the side of the lot. This made it difficult to have a deeper eave.

Commissioner Garapolo asked if any of the existing garage windows can be reused. Mr. Urbi-McCarthy said the windows are in bad shape. Additionally, one side of the garage will be directly facing a fence and they will be adding landscaping to block off the other wall, so they didn't find it prudent to add windows. Commissioner Sokol asked staff if this is a code issue. Planner Trexler said she is not aware of a code issue and noted that they have two garage type doors and one pedestrian door so may be meeting code requirements in that way.

Chair Weidner asked if they can use a hip roof and Mr. Urbi-McCarthy said he is open to this. Chair Weidner said the Commission typically asks for the roof to relate to the house roof, including the hip roof and overhangs.

Chair Weidner addressed the materials, noting that the siding will match the rear addition and not the front of the house. Mr. Urbi-McCarthy said the current garage does not have stucco or brick and cost was a consideration. Commissioner Sokol said that given the distance from the house, he is comfortable with picking up the siding type from the back of the house. Since it is a replacement, the shape of the roof is more important and matching the siding to the back of the house is sufficient. Commissioner Doherty agreed and said the garage will be partially obstructed by the entry. She said she is fine with the shingle Smartside option. Commissioner Chase agreed as long as the color and size are the same.

Chair Weidner asked the Commission for their thoughts on windows and Commissioner Andriana said she is ok without windows. Commissioners Garapolo and Sokol agreed, noting that there are a lot of doors.

*Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project with the conditions that the roof be a hip roof and the siding be LP shake. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 6-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, and Chair Weidner*

*NAY: None*

- D. HPC2021-46: 1112 Paulina St (Amber and Scott Elmer):** Certificate of Appropriateness to replace cedar shingle roof with asphalt shingles (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Scott Elmer, the homeowner, was present. He said that cost is a big factor as well as durability. He said their roofer didn't like the recent cedar shingle options as they don't have the same density and durability. Mr. Elmer said they have problem with squirrels that have chewed through the shingle roof and gotten into the house.

*Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

Commissioner Sokol said he has no questions or comments. Commissioner Garapolo said the homeowner did their due diligence and he doesn't have a problem with the replacement. Mr. Elmer said every other house in the neighborhood has moved to asphalt shingles, so theirs will not be out of place. Commissioner Sokol said this is reasonable under the circumstances. Chair Weidner agreed with Commissioner Garapolo and said it is clear that the shingles are reaching the end of their life.

Mr. Elmer said they picked the color because it is similar to wood and will go with the house when they paint it in the future. Commissioner Garapolo said he agrees with the "driftwood" color selection. Commissioner Doherty asked about the roofing on the garage and Mr. Elmer said it is currently asphalt but they will replace it to match the house.

*Motion by Commissioner Chase to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 6-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, and Chair Weidner*

*NAY: None*

- E. HPC2021-47: 606 Forest Ave (Luis Pagan and Diana Derige):** Certificate of Appropriateness for dormer alterations and additions (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. She said the applicant attended the Architectural Review Committee meeting on July 1, 2021. They were at that time proposing to lift the roof height, but at the recommendation of the ARC are now proposing dormer additions/alterations at the rear of the house instead.

Keith and Kristin Jones, the architects, were present. Mr. Jones described the proposal, including the need for additional space on the second floor and the evolution of the project. Ms. Jones said the house on the north side is very close so there will be minimal visibility on that side.

*Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

Commissioner Garapolo complimented the architects for their study and said the ARC had a lot of discussion on this project. The architects have come back with a good solution and he is in support. Commissioner Sokol said this is a practical and minimally-invasive solution, and people walking down the block won't even notice. Commissioner Andriana said she thinks this is a great idea and likes the execution of it. Chair Weidner said the ARC was concerned about precedent with raising

the roof height and Mr. Jones confirmed they found this hadn't really been done or approved before. Chair Weidner said he agrees this is a great solution and fits the Guidelines.

*Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Sokol. Motion approved 6-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, and Chair Weidner*

*NAY: None*

- F. HPC2021-48: 332 N Taylor Ave (Love Real Estate Solutions LLC):** Certificate of Appropriateness for renovation including a second story addition, restoration of original entrance, and new back deck on a one-story bungalow (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. She said this project was reviewed by the Architectural Review Committee on September 23, 2021, at which the main recommended change was to remove a matching dormer from the addition, which the applicant has done.

Jill Stumpf, the applicant, and Oscar Alba, the architect, both from Love Real Estate, were present.

*Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

Commissioner Garapolo said that some changes were made in accordance with the ARC's comments and it looks good. He said he is in favor of the revised proposal. Commissioner Doherty said she appreciates being able to see it in context with the other bungalows on the block. She said moving the entrance is more appropriate to the block and she appreciates that the stone wall will be retained.

Chair Weidner asked for clarification on the stucco repair. Ms. Stumpf said they will use stucco on the main level and the addition will have LP Smartside siding. She said they plan to repair the stucco but replacement may be needed. Commissioner Chase asked if the door is the same type as seen on the nearby bungalows. Ms. Stumpf confirmed it is and said the glass goes a little lower but the design of the door and sidelights are very similar. Commissioner Garapolo said to check building codes as the glass may need to be tempered. Mr. Alba said it will be tempered and, in reference to the neighboring houses, that people often fill in or raise the height to meet building code due to the cost of tempered glass.

*Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 6-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, and Chair Weidner*

*NAY: None*

- G. Historic Preservation Ordinance:** Prepare a recommendation to the Village Board regarding the adoption of the updated Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Chair Weidner introduced the item and Planner Trexler gave an overview. She said the Ordinance has been revised primarily to reflect current operations and precedents that have been set by the Commission. The updated Ordinance was provided to the Commission at the regular meeting on September 9, 2021, and no recommended revisions have been received since that date. She said the Ordinance will be provided to the Village Board in combination with the updated Architectural Review Guidelines, which were recommended for adoption by the HPC at the meeting on June 10, 2021.

*Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

Commissioner Sokol said that given ongoing discussions in the Village in terms of ADUs, there might be conflicts and he assumes this would be reviewed by the Board. Planner Trexler said the language being drafted for ADUs references the Historic Preservation Ordinance, so ADUs would have to follow the Ordinance like other projects.

Trustee Robinson requested that a red-lined version of the Ordinance edits be provided to the Board and Planner Trexler said this will be done.

*Motion by Commissioner Sokol to recommend approval of the updated Ordinance to the Village Board. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 6-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, and Chair Weidner*

*NAY: None*

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

### **- Oak Park Post Office**

Commissioner Sokol said he does not have any updates. He said they have not heard back from Representative Davis since calling him in August. They are still facing the same issues, including the ongoing repair, upkeep, and viability of this architectural treasure. He said Representation Davis seems to be interested and lots of people have talked to Commissioner Sokol about the post office since the newspaper article. He is telling them to reach out to their representatives. He encouraged the Commission to continue on this after his term is up and he would be happy to continue to be part of a work group.

Chair Weidner thanked Commissioner Sokol for his service at the Village and on the Historic Preservation Commission.

## **ADJOURN**

*Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Doherty. Motion approved 6-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, and Chair Weidner*

*NAY: None*

The meeting adjourned at 8:50PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.