

**Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
February 11, 2021 – Meeting Minutes
Remote Participation Meeting, 7:00 pm**

Roll Call

Present: Interim Chair Rebecca Houze and Commissioners Sandra Carr, Monique Chase, Sarah Doherty, Lou Garapolo, David Sokol, Noel Weidner, and Rachel Will
Absent: None
Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner
Attorney: Patrick Collins, Klein, Thorpe & Jenkins

Agenda Approval

Planner Trexler noted that there is a typo on the agenda and it should be 823 Fair Oaks Ave.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the agenda. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 7-0. (Note that Commissioner Weidner arrived following this vote.)

Commissioner Weidner arrived at the meeting.

Non-Agenda Public Comment

None

Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to approve the minutes for January 14, 2021. Second by Commissioner Doherty. Motion approved 8-0.

Regular Agenda

- A. HPC2021-4: 641 N Grove Ave (Brad Klein):** Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear addition, side mudroom addition, and removal of side door as part of a renovation project (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Interim Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. She said the applicant attended the Architectural Review Committee (ARC) meeting on January 28, 2021.

Present on behalf of the project were Drew Nelson, the architect, and Madeleine Klein, the homeowner. Mr. Nelson explained the project. He said the one-story mudroom will have the same siding as the house. The new addition is set in from the house and will have different siding. The front porch is currently 1x6, non-historic, wood slats. The homeowner would like to replace with smaller slats, such as 1x3.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.

Commissioner Garapolo said the ARC reviewed the project and felt the addition to be compatible. He said it will be minimally visible. Commissioner Sokol asked if the ARC had comments on the door

removal. Commissioner Weidner said he has no issues and likes the way it is drawn. Commissioner Garapolo agreed and said it is compatible. The Commission discussed the changes proposed to the door and window on the north elevation.

Commissioner Sokol said the additional is minimally visible and clearly an addition, so it is appropriate. He said the windows and siding relate to the historic windows and siding. Commissioner Will said the addition meets all the standards. It is clear that it is an addition. With the slope of the roof, there is minimal visibility. The driveway does, however, make it more visible than it would be otherwise. Mr. Nelson noted that the adjacent house is taller.

The Commission discussed the porch railing. Planner Trexler confirmed that as the existing railing is not historic, the replacement is not part of the Commission's purview. Commissioner Carr said the smaller railing will look more appropriate.

Commissioner Carr said the addition is modern for her taste but it fits in. She said the view from the driveway is concerning but it looks like the addition will blend in and be hidden in the back. The solar and green elements are nice to incorporate in a design like this one. Commissioner Chase agreed about the solar panels.

Chair Houze said she had concerns about the height, but as it does not extend beyond the sides of the house, it is not particularly visible. She asked if the roof sloping towards the house will cause problems. Mr. Nelson said they will properly seal and gutter that area. Chair Houze said she agrees with the ARC that it is nice to have the addition separate from the house.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for rear addition and alterations as proposed. Second by Commissioner Sokol. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Weidner, Commissioner Will, and Chair Houze

NAY: None

- B. HPC2021-5: 832 Fair Oaks Ave (Lou and Lexi Dore):** Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish existing garage and build a new garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Interim Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Present on behalf of the project were Brett Williams, the contractor, and Lou Dore, the homeowner. Mr. Williams explained the state of the existing garage and detailed the design choices of the new garage, including reusing historic windows leftover from renovating the house.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Weidner.

Commissioner Garapolo said he likes the roof design. He said the garage design is sympathetic to the house and he is in favor. Commissioner Carr asked about the material and Mr. Williams confirmed that it will be stucco. Commissioner Will said she likes the reuse of the historic windows. Commissioner Sokol said it is an excellent project. The design of the new garage is sensitive and it is clear that it is not historic.

Commissioner Weidner noted that the house was designed by van Bergen and asked about the history of the garage and possible drawings. Mr. Williams said this appears to be the historic garage. There is evidence of carriage doors and a steel structure and are now gone. Commissioner Weidner said he approves of the design and it is clear the existing garage is falling down. Commissioner Doherty agreed and said she appreciates the use of some of the original materials from the house. Chair Houze said it is clear the present garage needs to be replaced and she loves the idea of using the historic windows, emulating the rooflines of the historic house, and using stucco.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the existing garage and construction of a new garage as proposed. Second by Commissioner Carr. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Weidner, Commissioner Will, and Chair Houze

NAY: None

C. HPC2021-6: 312-314 Wisconsin Ave (Ambassador Condominium Association): Certificate of Appropriateness to replace clay tile roof with asphalt shingle (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Interim Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Mary Jane O'Brien was present on behalf of the Ambassador Condominium Association. She explained the location of the tile roof sections. She said they will be 100 years old in 2025. In the past, efforts have been made to prevent leaking. Some of the tiles were replaced with terra cotta-colored tiles. She said there is a lot of water damage in the third-floor units and they want to remove and replace everything correctly.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.

Commissioner Garapolo asked when the building became a condo building and if there was concern about the roof at that point. Ms. O'Brien said it became condos in 2002 and she is not aware of concern. She said she has read condo meeting minutes back through 2002 and questions came up about leaking at different points in time; as a full consensus is needed, different stopgaps were put into place rather than full repair. Commissioner Garapolo and Ms. O'Brien discussed the condo funds and the cost per unit of repair.

Commissioner Will asked if there has been any assessment to look at repairing the roofs, including options to replace just portions like the edges. Ms. O'Brien said they would be eager to do repair if it would cost less than the shingles. Commissioner Will said there needs to be more due diligence to show that 100 percent replacement is necessary. The clay tile, itself, looks good and they should identify where the leaking is occurring and the cause. Ms. O'Brien said they've had five different vendors and four also checked the interior. This is why they believe they have to go down to the wood and find out if there is mold or damage. The vendors said once they remove tiles, they will be brittle so may need to be replaced.

Chair Houze said from a historic preservation perspective, the clay tile is the highest tier roofing option for replacement material types. This is a character-defining feature for the building. The tile portions of the roof are relatively small and it would be a shame not to preserve them. Chair Houze said she looked into this architect and they specialized in this type of building with green tile roofs. The National Park Service preservation briefs identify that for a clay tile roof, asphalt shingles are an

incompatible substitute. Chair Houze agreed with Commissioner Will that more investigation is needed to see whether the leaking places can be repaired.

The Commission agreed that the tile does not appear to be the culprit. The Commission discussed that the costs do not reflect what repairs underneath might require, nor do they reflect replacement tile. Several Commissioners expressed that more information is needed.

Commissioner Sokol recommended having an architect or engineer take a look. He said he would be more comfortable with a professional opinion. Commissioner Will agreed and said they will be able to make selective openings. The leakage looks concentrated in specific locations along the edge; maybe it will be possible to repair and just replace the bottom layer of tiles. Commissioner Weidner said it could be the flashing at the parapet, behind the clay tile. Commissioner Garapolo agreed that this would be the best way to proceed. Ms. O'Brien said if it turns out to be something that is easier to fix and less expensive, they would be happy with that.

The Commission took no action on the item.

OTHER BUSINESS

- **Landmark Designation:** Chair Houze said the Telfer MacArthur Houze at 609 Linden was Landmarked by the Village Board this past week, at the February 1 Board meeting.
- **203 S Marion at Plan Commission:** Chair Houze said she represented the HPC at the February 4 Plan Commission meeting regarding 203 S Marion. She presented the determination of the HPC from their January Advisory Review of the proposed building. The Plan Commission meeting will resume at a later date, likely on February 18.
- **Oak Park Post Office:** Commissioner Sokol expressed concern about preservation of the post office. The Commission discussed options and agreed to discuss in small groups as permitted and proceed from there.

ADJOURN

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Weidner, Commissioner Will, and Chair Houze

NAY: None

The meeting adjourned at 8:30PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.