

**Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE
December 1, 2020 Meeting Minutes
Remote Participation Meeting, 7:00 pm**

A. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Committee Members Sandra Carr, Lou Garapolo, and Noel Weidner
ABSENT: None
STAFF: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

B. AGENDA

Motion by Garapolo to approve the agenda. Second by Carr. Motion approved 3-0.

*AYE: Carr, Garapolo, and Weidner
NAY: None*

C. MINUTES

Motion by Garapolo to approve minutes of the September 3, 2020. Second by Carr. Motion approved 3-0.

*AYE: Carr, Garapolo, and Weidner
NAY: None*

D. HPC2020-45: 512 S Ridgeland Ave (Mark Tryba): Certificate of Appropriateness to infill two windows on the side elevation (Gunderson Historic District).

Committee member Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary.

Mark Tryba, the homeowner, was present. Mr. Tryba said he took ownership of the building in early April. They discovered during tuckpointing that these two windows had plywood, drywall, and subway bricking on the interior as they are behind the showers. He said he is getting mold build-up and he installed exhaust fans to meet code. He found the windows are deteriorating. He said his contractor's recommendation was to fill the windows in.

Committee member Garapolo said he doesn't have a problem with bricking in the windows as they are hard to see from the street. He recommended keeping the stone sill and said

this has been done in the past to acknowledge there were windows and make it easier to reinstall windows should they be needed in the future.

Committee member Carr said it looks like the arch would remain and recommended the sill remain as well but this might depend on how much of a problem they are causing. Committee member Weidner agreed and said this has been done in the past. The sills can be flashed and sealed up.

Committee member Carr made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that the window sills are retained. Second by Committee member Garapolo. Approved 3-0.

AYE: Carr, Garapolo, and Weidner

NAY: None

- E. HPC2020-46: 828 Gunderson Ave (Matthew Eade):** Certificate of Appropriateness for window alterations on the side elevation. Discuss proposed alterations to the front porch and alteration to window on the front elevation (Gunderson Historic District).

Committee member Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary. Planner Trexler noted that there are two items for review: alterations to windows on the side elevation, which can be approved by the ARC, and alterations to the front porch and a window on the front elevation, which must go to the full HPC for approval. She said the Committee should provide recommendations on the second portion.

Kimberlee Smith, the architect, and Mathew Eade, the homeowner, were present. Ms. Smith described the project. Mr. Eade said he bought the house in April. He said the house will require a lot of work. He went to the Historical Society but there was limited documentation on this particular house. He said described his main goals: repair electrical, mechanical, and plumbing; upgrade the kitchen and bathrooms; expand the house; and restore the historic character of the exterior including the porch. He said he plans to restore the original wood lap siding. He described the issues uncovered on the porch and their reasoning for requested changes.

Committee member Carr asked about the bay windows on the north and the art glass. Mr. Eade said the original art glass is gone; the only remaining art glass is on the front and in the stairwell. Ms. Smith explained the window alterations requested on the north side elevation.

Committee member Garapolo said he has no issues with the side window alterations. Committee member Weidner agreed.

The Committee discussed the request to center the window on the front elevation. Ms. Smith said there are examples of both in the district. Committee member Garapolo said he does not have a problem with centering the window. He said he is pleased to hear that the wood siding will be restored. Committee member Carr said she approves of centering the window and she hadn't noticed that some are off-center. She asked if the existing trim details would remain on the porch. Mr. Eade said they would keep the trim details.

Ms. Smith said the Gunderson houses seem to always have two bedrooms at the front on the second floor so it is unclear why the window wouldn't be centered.

Committee member Garapolo asked about the original porch design. Ms. Smith said it has a half-height wall with scuppers but is collecting water on the top of the wall. She said this is why they are looking to alter the design to an open rail. She said the current columns are wrought iron and they are looking to improve these. She said they will use 2x2-inch balusters with tight spacing to match the neighborhood. Committee member Garapolo said he likes the new design. He said the drawing shows different detailing. Ms. Smith said this was drawn before the historic treatment was uncovered. Mr. Eade said the original detail is beautiful and he would like to keep it. Some repair will be needed for the siding on the column but the top is in good condition. Committee member Weidner said these details should be added to the drawings and it should be made clear that the siding will be kept on the columns on the ends.

Motion by Committee member Garapolo to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the window changes on the side elevation as proposed. Second by Committee member Carr. Approved 3-0.

AYE: Carr, Garapolo, and Weidner

NAY: None

- F. 232 N Scoville Ave (Alex and Larissa Leibowitz):** Discuss proposal to demolish existing garage and build a new coach house (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Committee member Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary.

Alex and Larissa Leibowitz, the homeowners, were present. They described their project.

Committee member Garapolo said they should get a cost estimate for repair. He said he didn't have a problem with demolition but asked why a coach house is proposed. Ms. Leibowitz said they are hoping to use the coach house as a home office. Committee member Garapolo said he does not have an issue with that. He said they should provide

detail drawings showing how it will relate to the house, including the window and siding types. He asked why the roof is shown as flat on top in the drawing. Mr. Leibowitz said the drawing is showing how the height would work and that they plan to match the roof of the existing garage.

Committee member Carr said the materials and trim should match the house and these details should be called out in the drawings. She said she doesn't think it's out of scale with the house. Committee member Weidner agreed with the previous comments. He said he likes the example coach house (photo provided) with the small, punched window, and recommended taking cues from this design. He said the hip roof with the overhang and the trim are important. Committee member Garapolo agreed about the small window and said the example coach house does not look too large.

- G. 315 N Euclid Ave (Stephen and Mary Jo Schuler):** Discuss proposed alterations to existing dormers and a proposed new dormer (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Committee member Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler provided a summary.

Tom Bair, the architect, was present, along with Stephen and Mary Jo Schuler, the homeowners. Mr. Bair described the project to the Committee.

Committee member Garapolo asked why the new dormer on the north elevation won't be centered over the wing. Mr. Bair said this is to accommodate the interior beams and bearing walls. Committee member Garapolo said he doesn't have a problem with the east dormer but the south dormer would be very visible if the trees weren't there. He said a knee wall might look better than a railing as it would blend in with the roof shapes there now, similar to the balcony at 309 Home Ave. Mr. Bair said this would be possible. Committee member Carr said the balcony will be obscured by the turret and Mr. Bair said a wall would make it more prominent. Mr. Schuler said the railing proposed would match the railings on the front and back porches and said they prefer consistency. He said having light come through the railings is something they are looking for. He said the house at 324 N Euclid, across the street, has a similar balcony with a railing. Committee member Garapolo said 324 N Euclid is different and he does not think a railing would look good.

Committee member Carr said the dormer alterations on the east elevation bother her the most. Committee member Weidner agreed and said they are almost doubling the size of the dormer and it will start to take over the front elevation.

Mr. Schuler said they spend some time going around the neighborhood and there are a lot of large dormers. He said they can provide more pictures. Committee member Weidner said

this would be helpful. He said the north elevation dormer above the gable is not something he has seen a lot.

Committee member Carr said it would be helpful to have a sketch-up model in 3D of the front so the Commission can better understand the size. She said seeing it flat makes it look a little bigger than it would from the street. Even a sketch on top of a photograph would be helpful. Mr. Bair said the side dormers really would be visible from the street. He said the grade is high and the house is above street level. Committee member Weidner recommended including addition photos from the street and from the south.

H. Other Business

I. Adjourn

Motion by Carr to adjourn. Second by Garapolo. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Carr, Garapolo, and Weidner

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 8:00PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.