

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
February 13, 2020 – Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall Council Chambers, Room 215, 7:30 pm

Roll Call

Present: Commissioners Jennifer Bridge, Sandra Carr, Monique Chase, Lou Garapolo, David Sokol, and Noel Weidner
Absent: Acting Chair Rebecca Houze, Commissioner Derrick Gurski, and Commissioner Aleksandra Tadic
Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner
Attorney: Greg Smith, Klein, Thorpe & Jenkins

Speaker

Commissioner Garapolo introduced Tony Hyatt, of the Cedar Shake & Shingle Bureau. Mr. Hyatt gave a presentation about cedar shakes and shingles. In the presentation, Mr. Hyatt explained how to make cedar shakes and shingles last. He discussed the difference between shakes and shingles, explained the types and grades of wood, and how the wood moves as it absorbs moisture. Mr. Hyatt explained the correct use of fasteners and felt, noting that non-permeable membranes should not be used with wood shingle and shakes as they trap moisture and don't allow the wood to breathe. He detailed cleaning techniques for this like removing moss.

Debra McQueen, a member of the audience, clarified the different materials used under shake compared to shingle. Felt is used for shake only. She asked how the two materials compare in longevity. Mr. Hyatt said he has seen shingles last 80-90 years and shakes may last 50. Shingles last longer.

Commissioner Weidner asked if the 3-ply system was used historically and Mr. Hyatt confirmed. Commissioner Weidner asked about the use of mesh products underneath. Mr. Hyatt said they are currently testing these materials but the tests may run for 10 years.

Commissioner Carr arrived at 7:15PM, making a quorum.

Mr. Hyatt explained that requirements vary; for example, Florida requires the use of felt under every layer of shingle with the intent of additional protection during hurricane winds, though the additional material may not help.

Commissioner Sokol asked if there is any shake in Oak Park and the Commission agreed that there isn't much. Mr. Hyatt said shake is most common with Cape Cod houses and he also sees it with the Colonial Revival style.

Commissioner Weidner asked about the pricing of cedar compared to asphalt. Mr. Hyatt said cedar costs more, primarily due to installation. The installation of cedar roofing may take a week while the installation of asphalt roofing may be completed in a day. Commissioner Garapolo said that people generally want asphalt because they can't afford cedar.

The Commission discussed the longevity of wood. Commissioner Garapolo noted the importance of correct installation. Commissioner Weidner asked if there are certified installers. Mr. Hyatt said the

cedar is inspected at the mills and the Cedar Shake and Shingle Bureau provides trainings for installation.

The Commission thanked Mr. Hyatt for his presentation.

Agenda Approval

Planner Trexler noted that Interim Chair Rebecca Houze is absent. Attorney Smith verified that the Commission should select an Acting Chair for the meeting. Commissioner Weidner volunteered.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to appoint Commissioner Weider as Acting Chair for the meeting. Second by Commissioner Sokol.

AYE: Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, and Commissioner Weidner

NAY: None

Motion by Commissioner Bridge to approve the agenda. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 6-0.

Non-Agenda Public Comment

None

Minutes

Commissioner Garapolo said he thought there were more people in attendance regarding the Oak Park Ave resurfacing project and asked that this be checked. Planner Trexler said she would verify this with Public Works.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to approve the minutes for January 9, 2020, with the edits mentioned. Second by Commissioner Bridge. Motion approved 6-0.

Regular Agenda

- A. HPC2020-5: 535 N Marion St (Elizabeth Austin & Randall Kulat):** Certificate of Appropriateness to add a rear dormer as part of an attic remodel (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Debra McQueen, the architect, was present. She said the new dormer will be on the west as stated and noted the north arrow was incorrect on one of the drawings.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Sokol.

Commissioner Carr said the project appears to be straight forward. Commissioner Garapolo said it looks good. Acting Chair Weider asked whether the chimney would intersect the new dormer and Ms. McQueen said it would not.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the new dormer as proposed. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, and Commissioner Weidner

NAY: None

- B. HPC 2020-6: Unity Temple, 875 Lake St (UTP, LLC):** Certificate of Appropriateness to add a sign with a plaque in front of the building (Landmark and Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Heidi Ruehle, Executive Director of the Unity Temple Restoration Foundation, was present. Ms. Ruehle said the plaque design is by UNESCO and the Frank Lloyd Wright Building Conservancy and matches the plaques for the other Frank Lloyd Wright Buildings with the UNESCO designation.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Bridge.

Commissioner Garapolo said the design is nice and the placement is good. He asked about the height. Ms. Ruehle clarified the measurements and said a portion of the post shown in the drawing will be underground. Commissioners Sokol and Bridge agreed that there will be no impact on the landmark.

Motion by Commissioner Carr to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a plaque as proposed. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, and Commissioner Weidner

NAY: None

- C. HPC2020-7: 231 S Grove Ave (Daniel & Ann Retzner):** Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear, two-story addition and three new windows on the existing side elevations as part of interior renovation (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Acting Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Christopher Bremer, the architect, was present. Mr. Bremer explained the project, which includes a 2.5-story rear addition. They will use a vertical trim board and siding, instead of a masonry foundation, to delineate new from old.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.

Commissioner Garapolo said the proposed project looks good. Commissioner Carr said the addition is a good scale and the window spacing and proportion are appropriate.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the new addition and window alterations as proposed. Second by Commissioner Carr. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, and Commissioner Weidner

NAY: None

OTHER BUSINESS

- Planner Trexler informed the Commission that Commissioner Gurski has stepped down following his first term. There are currently three vacant seats on the Commission.
- Planner Trexler updated the Commission on the revised Architectural Review Guidelines. It is the current intent of the Village to update the Guidelines and the Historic Preservation Ordinance in conjunction with each other. The Commission will be provided both for review when suggested revisions are complete.

ADJOURN

Motion by Commissioner Carr to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.

The meeting adjourned at 7:50PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.