

**Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
November 14, 2019 - Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm**

Roll Call

Present: Acting Chair Rebecca Houze and Commissioners Tom Abrahamson, Jennifer Bridge, Lou Garapolo, David Sokol, Aleksandra Tadic and Noel Weidner
Absent: Commissioners Sandra Carr, Derrick Gurski, and Laura Jordahl
Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner
Attorney: Brian Gorka, Klein, Thorpe & Jenkins

Agenda Approval

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the agenda. Second by Commissioner Bridge. Motion approved 7-0.

Non-Agenda Public Comment

None

Minutes

Acting Chair Houze said she has two minor edits that she will provide to Planner Trexler.

Motion by Commissioner Bridge to approve the minutes for October 10, 2019. Second by Commissioner Tadic. Motion approved 7-0.

Regular Agenda

- A. HPC2019-65: 316 N Ridgeland Ave (JP Rodriguez):** Certificate of Appropriateness to infill three windows to accommodate interior renovation (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Jose Rodriguez, the homeowner, was present. He explained that he is replacing windows and will infill some windows to accommodate a kitchen remodel.

Motion by Commissioner Tadic to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.

Commissioner Garapolo noted that the new windows on the front elevation are casement and asked why they won't match. Mr. Rodriguez said the existing windows are casements and also have storm windows. Planner Trexler noted that the windows in question are part of the Advisory Review and are not part of the Certificate of Appropriateness application. Commissioner Weidner recommended replacing the storm windows and keeping the historic windows on the inside. Commissioner Garapolo agreed.

Acting Chair Houze clarified that the Certificate of Appropriateness is to infill spaces on the north and south elevations. Commissioner Weidner said he does not have a problem with the infill

proposed and suggests keeping the sills. The Commission discussed whether sills should be retained on all four infilled windows and agreed that the sill does not need to be retained on the north window that will be replaced with a smaller window. Commissioner Sokol said this is an honest way of showing what was there.

Motion by Commissioner Weidner to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed, with the condition that the sill be retained on 3 windows (with the exception of the one to be replaced with a smaller window). Second by Commissioner Tadic. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Tadic, Commissioner Weidner, and Acting Chair Houze

NAY: None

- B. HPC2019-66: 539 Woodbine Ave (Bob and Sue Merz):** Certificate of Appropriateness to infill windows at rear second floor sunroom as part of an interior renovation (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Pat Magner, the architect, was present. He explained that they are changing the sunroom into a bedroom. The existing windows are inswing casements but they will replace with outswing casements. New siding will match existing.

Motion by Commissioner Abrahamson to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.

Commissioner asked Mr. Magner about the sill. The Commission discussed whether retaining the sills and agreed in this case it may not be appropriate. Commissioner Tadic said that with so many additions on the rear, the sill would look added and would harm the house.

Motion by Commissioner Abrahamson to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Weidner. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Tadic, Commissioner Weidner, and Acting Chair Houze

NAY: None

- C. HPC2019-67: 619-623 N Grove Ave (619: Marilyn and Royse Crampton; 623: Kelly Turner):** Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish existing shared garage and build two new, separate garages (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Greg Kapral, of Golden K Construction, was present. He explained that there is an existing 3-car garage that appears to be from two different constructions. They cannot close the garage doors, the floor is cracked, and the garage's deterioration is a hazard.

Motion by Commissioner Weidner to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Tadic.

The Commission discussed whether there should be one or two COAs. It was agreed that the project should be approved as two COAs, one for each address.

Commissioner Sokol said the garage appears to be in poor shape has no relevance to the architecture of the district, and he has no issue with demolition. He said that having two discrete garages makes sense.

Acting Chair Houze asked for clarification of garage sizes. Mr. Kapral explained that the existing garage consists of a 20x20 portion and a 20x10 portion adjoining. It will be replaced with two 20x20 garages.

Commissioner Garapolo said the Commissioner typically prefers to have statement from a structural engineer confirming the deteriorated state of the garage. He asked for details about the rated wall, construction method, and construction materials. Mr. Kapral said there will be a fire wall on the interior wall of both garages, they will feature 5/8 drywall, and they will have vinyl triple-ply siding.

Motion by Commissioner Tadic to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project at 619 N Grove Ave as proposed, with the condition that drawings be revised to show details discussed. Second by Commissioner Weidner. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Tadic, Commissioner Weidner, and Acting Chair Houze

NAY: None

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project at 623 N Grove Ave as proposed, with the condition that the drawings be revised to show details discussed. Second by Commissioner Weidner. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Tadic, Commissioner Weidner, and Acting Chair Houze

NAY: None

- D. HPC2019-68: 300 N Kenilworth Ave (Mat and Rakhi Thambi):** Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration and small addition on rear and side elevations (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

William Scholtens, the architect, was present. He explained the project in detail to the Commission, stating that there is an existing 7-foot cantilever currently supported by a non-original bracket, that the addition will help support. Foundation stone will be reused if possible or replaced to match. The water table trim band will be continued and the corner board will be retained. New windows will be double-hung sash windows and will match the predominant head height of other windows in the house.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Tadic.

Commissioner Tadic said the addition is tasteful and she appreciates the attention to detail. She asked why the sill on the east elevation is not the same. Mr. Scholtens said the sill height was raised to accommodate the kitchen counter with backsplash. He said that there are varying sill heights on the house already but they kept the heads consistent.

Commissioner Garapolo and Abrahamson agreed that the proposal was well thought-out. The Commission discussed the garage and lot size; Mr. Scholtens said the garage is not part of this project. It was noted that while two garages appear on the site plan, the lot is irregular in shape and one of the garages belongs to the neighbor.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Tadic, Commissioner Weidner, and Acting Chair Houze

NAY: None

- E. HPC2019-69: 401 N Harvey Ave (Abby Imrem):** Certificate of Appropriateness to renovate the house including adding a side porch and French doors, changing a second floor door to a window, and replacing the front door and door surround (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Acting Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. Planner Trexler said that the applicant attended the October 23, 2019, Architectural Review Committee meeting. The ARC had two recommendations: that the front door matches the existing door as closely as possible and that details are provided regarding any plans for the front stoop.

Kindon Mills, the architect, was present. She explained the project to the Commission, noting that the pilasters and pediment around the door were previously removed and will be replaced. She said that no work is currently planned for the front stoop.

Motion by Commissioner Tadic to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Weidner.

Commissioner Garapolo said they discussed this project at the Architectural Review Committee meeting. He said it appears to comply and is a great improvement. Commissioner Weidner requested that the front door trim be included as part of the motion to ensure it is part of the approved project.

Motion by Commissioner Bridge to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed, with the condition that the door trim be added as shown in drawings. Second by Commissioner Weidner. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Tadic, Commissioner Weidner, and Acting Chair Houze

NAY: None

- F. HPC2019-70: 1023 Chicago Ave (David Lewis):** Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of decorative wood window on the front of the house (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

David Lewis, the homeowner, was present. Mr. Lewis said he moved into the house 18 months ago and learned there are several projects they need to undertake. They prioritized this window when the pane broke. Mr. Lewis said they found the problem was more than the pane and some contractors would not even replace the window due to the rotten wood.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Sokol.

Commissioner Garapolo thanked the homeowner for their presentation and asked which of the proposals provided is preferred. Mr. Lewis said their contractor is Next Door & Window. Mr. Lewis said that the window proposed by Pella may not actually match and Pella found they could not replace the window due to wood rot.

Commissioner Garapolo said the pattern is important and should match. Mr. Lewis said the arch at the top will feature an arc rather than the Gothic pattern.

Commissioner Tadic asked why a quote to repair the window was not provided and Mr. Lewis said all of the contractors said they would not repair the window. Commissioner Tadic said the window is a major feature of the house and repair is recommended. The Village keeps a list of some of the contractors that can repair windows. Mr. Lewis said he has received that list but repairing the window will not solve the rotten frame. Commissioner Tadic said repair would include the trim. Commissioner Abrahamson said there are repair people that can rebuild a window like this; they may be able to add a storm and it may cost less.

Commissioner Garapolo recommended that they may be able to just repair the top portion with the Gothic pattern and replace the other portions. Commissioner Abrahamson said he can send a few recommendations.

Acting Chair Houze said this window feature is essential. The only option is to repair or replace to match, especially the top, Gothic portion. Commissioner Abrahamson noted that the glass can be replaced with energy efficient glass. Commissioner Weidner said a temporary solution would be to fix the broken pane and add an interior storm window.

The Commission took no action.

- G. HPC2019-71: 818 N Elmwood Ave (Albert and Beth Benedict):** Certificate of Appropriateness to replace front storm door and alter windows in more permanent enclosure of front stoop (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

John Simmons, the contractor, was present. He said they are converting the enclosed stoop into a functional mudroom. It will have double-hung sash windows and a built-in on the back wall. They will replace the existing screen door and sidelight with a new door/sidelight. The new windows will match the windows on the front of the house.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Weidner.

Commissioner Garapolo said the 5-light sidelight is important. He said the door looks appropriate, moving the windows is not a problem, and matching the windows to the house is a good idea.

Commissioner Weidner asked if the 5-light sidelight can be replaced to match. Mr. Simmons said it can. Commissioner Weidner asked if the sidelight needs to be replaced and Mr. Simmons said it is no efficient and they want to insulate the space. Commissioners Sokol and Houze said they think replacement to match is appropriate.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed, with the condition that the new sidelight be a 5-light sidelight to match existing. Second by Commissioner Tadic. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Tadic, Commissioner Weidner, and Acting Chair Houze

NAY: None

- H. HPC2019-72: 126 S Euclid Ave (Diane Schneider):** Certificate of Appropriateness to replace wood shingle roof with asphalt shingles (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Acting Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Diane Schneider, the homeowner, was present. Ms. Schneider said she has been the homeowner for 35 years and when she bought to house it had multiple layers: wood shake and four layers of asphalt shingles. She replaced it was cedar but would not do this again due to leaks, bugs, and critters. She said she has done a lot to restore the interior of the house and the roof needs to be sturdier. The contractors said wood roofs now last only 12-14 years.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Weidner.

Commissioner Garapolo asked what is proposed and Ms. Schneider presented samples of existing and proposed shingles. She said the contractor recommended a lighter gray/white as it is more reflective, but she is fine with doing either a brown or a gray.

Commissioner Weidner said the Commission has allowed asphalt previously but that the Commission will be discussing wood roof technology this evening if Ms. Schneider would like to stay. There are underlays you can use that extend the life of wood shingles. Ms. Schneider said replacing with wood is outside her budget.

Commissioner Tadic said a cost estimate for replacement with wood shingles is required. Ms. Schneider said she had difficulty getting an estimate from contractors. Commissioner Bridge said the cost must be provided to prove infeasibility. Acting Chair Houze agreed that a quote for replacement to match is needed as this is the preference of the Commission. Ms. Schneider confirmed with the Commission that a total cost estimate is appropriate and the Commission agreed. It was agreed that Ms. Schneider would return to the Commission with a cost of replacement to match.

The Commission took no action.

- I. HPC2019-73: 710 S Elmwood Ave (Stephen Casper and Karen Casper-Strauss):** Certificate of Appropriateness for rebuilding and remodeling the rear two stories of the house, including adding a corner tower and side deck (Gunderson Historic District).

Acting Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. Planner Trexler said the applicant attended the Architectural Review Committee meeting on October 23 and the ARC had two main comments: that the deck be more consistent with the front porch/stairs and that the rear corner turret is more in keeping with the shape of the bay window rather than round.

Steve Casper, the homeowner, was present. He said the updated the turret design and added square balusters to the porch railings to match the front stairs. They will match the new siding to the existing siding.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Abrahamson.

Commissioner Garapolo said he is concerned that the deck renderings show a round turret. Planner Trexler said the applicant confirmed the turret will match the plans but the elevation just shows the updated deck. Commissioner Sokol said the project looks unified. The Commission agreed that they would like to see an updated rendering showing the octagonal tower.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed, with the condition that the ARC provides final review and approval. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Tadic, Commissioner Weidner, and Acting Chair Houze

NAY: None

OTHER BUSINESS

- **Cedar roofs:** installation techniques effecting life cycle

Commissioner Weidner said he learned about a mesh underlayment that allows air movement so moisture can escape. Commissioner Sokol said this does not address the fragility of cedar. Commissioner Weidner said the quality of installation is also important, including the amount of shingle overlap. It was aged more research is needed. Commissioner Sokol said that the problem is the incredible difference in cost. Commissioner Abrahamson said that you cannot layer cedar or tile. You have to seal cedar every year. He said he hired a consultant who can advice on exposure, a mesh underlay, and recommended an ice shielf the first 5-6 feet.

The Commission discussed having technical sheets or brochures to provide better information to homeowners. They agreed that more research must be done.

- **Commission updates**

Acting Chair Houze said that the Historic Preservation awards jury met on November 2 and made their selections. She invited Commissioners to attend the Oak Park Historic Preservation Awards, which will occur on December 11 at 7PM in Village Hall Council Chambers.

Acting Chair Houze brought up the realtor event and asked any interested Commissioners contact her.

Acting Chair Houze informed the Commission that the Village Board approved the new Oak Park Landmark at 408 N Kenilworth Ave.

ADJOURN

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.

The meeting adjourned at 9:30PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.