

**Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
May 9, 2019 - Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:00 pm**

Roll Call

Present: Chair Christopher Payne and Commissioners Sandra Carr, Lou Garapolo, Darrick Gurski, Rebecca Houze, and David Sokol
Absent: Commissioners Tom Abrahamson, Jennifer Bridge, Laura Jordahl, Aleksandra Tadic and Noel Weidner
Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner
Attorney: Gregory Smith, Klein, Thorpe & Jenkins

Agenda Approval

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the agenda; Second by Commissioner Gurski; Motion approved 6-0.

Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Carr to approve draft minutes for April 24, 2019; Second by Commissioner Garapolo; Motion approved 6-0.

Regular Agenda

- A. HPC2019-20: 140 S Euclid Ave (David Schacht):** Certificate of Appropriateness to remove existing asphalt siding on second floor gable ends and dormers and replace with stucco (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Meredith Schacht, the homeowner, was present. Ms. Schacht said she is available for questions.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Garapolo.

Commissioner Garapolo asked what is under the asphalt siding and Ms. Schacht said it appears to be wood lathe. Commissioner Carr and Chair Payne expressed approval of the project.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the existing asphalt siding on the second floor and replace with stucco. Second by Commissioner Carr. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Gurski, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Sokol, and Chair Payne

NAY: None

- B. HPC2019-21: 855 Lake St (Icon Clark LLC):** Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of sections of wall to accommodate new AC units (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Bill Kokalias, principle architect for the project, was present. Mr. Kokalias said that this is part of a seven-story building remodel that will include replacing windows, adding canopy lights, creating openings for new AC units, replacing the rooftop railing, and replacing rusted grills on old AC units to match with the new units. He stated that the new AC units would be located primarily on the east façade.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Houze.

It was clarified that the windows alterations would be submitted for Advisory Review. Commissioner Garapolo asked if in-building AC was possible and Mr. Kokalias said that due to the age and size of the building, this would be prohibitively expensive.

The Commission discussed the color of the current AC units and future AC units, agreeing that a darker color similar to the brick is preferable. Mr. Kokalias said that he is open to this.

Motion by Commissioner Carr to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the addition of new AC units and the replacement of the rooftop railing, with the condition that the new AC units are a dark color similar to the brick and the railing is black. Second by Commissioner Gurski. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Gurski, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Sokol, and Chair Payne

NAY: None

- C. HPC2019-22: 715-717 Washington Blvd (Washington Place Condo Association):** Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of four feet of a chimney (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Marc Livingston, of Brian Allendorfer Company, was present. Mr. Livingston described the project and stated that the chimney has structural cracks and rebuilding or removing the chimney entirely would be cost-prohibitive.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Garapolo.

Commissioner Gurski asked if the chimney is original to the building and Mr. Livingston confirmed that it is. The Commission clarified where the associated roof work will be done and clarified that aside from the chimney, the work will not be visible from the street. Chair Payne said that the chimney does not appear to be a character defining feature and does not have any ornamentation, so he supports the project.

Motion by Commissioner Carr to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the top four feet of the chimney as proposed. Second by Commissioner Gurski. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Gurski, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Sokol, and Chair Payne

NAY: None

- D. HPC2019-23: 631 N Kenilworth Ave (Jadwiga Mulka and Abebe Gemedu):** Certificate of Appropriateness for renovation including restoration of the front porch and windows, demolition

of the chimney, and a rear addition (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview and said that the applicant attended the ARC meeting on April 24, 2019.

Jadwiga Mulka, the homeowner, was present. Ms. Mulka said that the project is to renovate the house and restore it back to its original appearance.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Houze.

Commissioner Garapolo said that the applicant attended the April ARC meeting and, based on the plans, the applicant took the recommendations given by the ARC. Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Carr, and Chair Payne agreed that the project is a good attempt to remove incompatible additions.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the house renovation as proposed. Second by Commissioner Carr. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Gurski, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Sokol, and Chair Payne

NAY: None

- E. HPC2019-24: 824 Woodbine Ave (Joseph Thompson and Kelsey Manning):** Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition and replacement of the garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Joe Thompson, the homeowner, and Dave Krecek, the contractor, were present. Mr. Thompson said that they want a new garage in part for safety reasons. Mr. Krecek said that the existing garage is old and the foundation is broken. Repair is not feasible, as it would necessitate lifting the building to pour a new foundation. The vinyl siding is consistent with other garages in the neighborhood.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Sokol.

Commissioner Garapolo said that the gable roof is compatible with the house and he is in favor of the project. Commissioner Sokol asked the homeowner if he would consider wood siding to match the house. The homeowner responded that the distance from the street is such that the material isn't visible and wood would be more expensive. He said that he selected a 3-inch vinyl to match the house siding width and there are many vinyl-sided garages in the neighborhood.

Commissioner Houze asked if it is taller. Mr. Krecek said that it will be approximately four feet taller than existing to accommodate a storage space.

Motion by Commissioner Gurski to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the garage demolition and replacement as proposed. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Gurski, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Sokol, and Chair Payne

NAY: None

- F. HPC2019-25: 426 S Austin Blvd (Jean Montgomery):** Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement using windows that match in appearance but vinyl in material (Landmark; not in a historic district). April 2019 window replacement did not match material or grid placement.

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Jean Montgomery, condo owner, was present. She stated that she is available for questions.

Motion by Commissioner Houze to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Sokol.

The Commission discussed the location of the windows and whether the condo association has bylaws. The Commission asked why the windows didn't match historic and Ms. Montgomery said she didn't realize the grill pattern was different. Chair Payne stated that there was an issue there and an issue that the windows were ordered before they were approved. It was implied that the new windows would match this historic windows. However, the grill pattern does not match and the grill is inside the glass.

Commissioner Carr said there appear to be lots of mismatched windows on the building. John Porter, neighbor of the applicant, was present. Mr. Porter said that all the front windows are the same but the storm windows differ.

The Commission discussed their recourse. Attorney Smith stated that they can approve a retro-active COA for the current windows or the project is in violation of the Ordinance. The Commission asked if there is a homeowner association and a member of the audience state that there is.

Commissioner Sokol reviewed the sheet submitted by Tayloe Glass and stated that he would like to see if the mullions can be on the exterior of the window to match historic. Chair Payne concurred and said it is hard to approve when the proposal is unclear. He recommended that the Commission take no action until a more detailed proposal is received from Tayloe Glass and that the mullions should be on the exterior of the glass. Commissioners Sokol and Garapolo agreed. Chair Payne stated that the Commission would be taking no action.

- G. HPC2019-26: 807 Woodbine Ave (Kelly and Lorence Pope):** Certificate of Appropriateness for the alteration of the front dormer roof shape from a hip to a gable to accommodate an interior renovation (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Lorence Pope, homeowner, was present. Mr. Pope said that a second floor was previously added so the house is no longer a traditional bungalow. He said that the change in the dormer shape will add value to the house and the end result will be a replica of the neighboring house. The larger window will add curb appeal and living space. He said that the window would also increase natural light in the house.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Garapolo.

Commissioner Garapolo asked about the height and material of the proposed dormer. Mr. Pope said that it will maintain the existing height but will appear to be two-feet taller. He said that it is currently clad in asphalt shingles but they would like to use cedar shingles to match the addition.

Chair Payne said that he cannot support this as the roofing policy says roof form and shape should be maintained. Commissioner Houze said that it doesn't make much of a difference and

Commissioner Garapolo noted that the original architecture has already been modified. Chair Payne said that typically bump-outs are allowed farther back from the street and he would not have supported the existing second floor addition. He does not support changing it now.

Mr. Pope asked if they can change the window and siding if the roof change is not approved. Chair Payne stated that these items can usually be approved administratively.

Commissioner Gurski said that he knows the builder and asked if he should recuse himself. Attorney Smith said that Commissioner Gurski should recuse himself if he cannot fairly consider this project.

Commissioner Sokol said that he respects the Chair's position but in this case, there have been many changes already and the proposed changes would match the neighboring house so he is in support of the project.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed change to the dormer roof shape and siding. Second by Commissioner Gurski. No action 4-2.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Gurski, Commissioner Houze, and Commissioner Sokol

NAY: Commissioner Garapolo and Chair Payne

OTHER BUSINESS

- Day in Our Village

Chair Payne said he wanted the Commission to be aware that Day in Our Village is coming up and he wants to have handouts ready. Commissioner Sokol said that they need to have more outreach and creativity to draw people.

The Commission discussed window restoration and the possibilities of having a demonstration or examples of different types of windows. The Commission agreed that they are interested in having a table at Day in Our Village.

- Education Subcommittee

Chair Payne said that he discussed the Education Subcommittee with Tammie Grossman at the Village and they are working on options. The Commission discussed having the Education Subcommittee meet prior to the ARC. It was asked if a staff member is required to be present. Chair Payne said that he would follow up with staff.

ADJOURN

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to adjourn. Second by Commissioner Garapolo.

The meeting adjourned at 8:45PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Urban Planner Historic Preservation.