# Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission November 8, 2018 - Meeting Minutes Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

A recording of this meeting is available on the Village of Oak Park Website: https://www.oak-park.us/your-government/citizen-commissions/commission-tv

**Roll Call** 

Present: Chair Christopher Payne, Darrick Gurski, David Sokol, Jennifer Bridge, Noel Weidner, and

Laura Jordahl

Absent: Tom Abrahamson, Sandra Carr, Aleksandra Tadic, Rebecca Houze

Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

Attorney: Gregory Smith, Klein, Thorpe & Jenkins

#### Agenda Approval

Motion by Commissioner Gurski to approve the agenda as amended; Second by Commissioner Jordahl; Motion approved 6-0.

#### Non-Agenda Public Comment – None

Chair Payne noted that there are only six Commission members present and six is a quorum. For approval from the Commission, votes must be unanimous. If any are not unanimous, the following procedure will be explained to the applicant.

## Minutes-

Motion by Commissioner Abrahamson to approve draft minutes for October 11, 2018; Second by Commissioner Weidner; Motion approved 6-0.

#### **Regular Agenda**

**A. HPC 2018-43: 733 Woodbine Avenue (Gharavi):** Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear and side addition (Frank Lloyd Wright Prairie School Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application.

Planner Trexler presented the staff's report indicating the guidelines relevant for the application review. She indicated that the project was previously presented at the October 11, 2018, meeting but has been altered to address Commission concerns.

Mr. Lance Shalzi, architect for the homeowner, provided an overview of the proposal and updates. Changes to the plan include a lower roofline on the addition, an added window on the front elevation, kitchen hood exhaust moved to the side façade, and small hip roof on front first floor bump out changed to shed roof.

Motion by Commissioner Jordahl to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Bridge

The Commission expressed that the concerns from the October 11 meeting have been appropriately addressed.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness according to the plans presented; Second by Commissioner Gurski; approved by Roll Call Vote as follows:

```
Bridge – yes
Sokol – yes
Gurski – yes
Weidner – yes
Jordahl – yes
Payne – yes
```

**B. HPC 2018-44: 718 Gunderson (Jones):** Demolition of existing garage and construction of new garage at same location (Gunderson Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application.

Planner Trexler presented the staff's report indicating the guidelines relevant for the application review. She noted that the garage the applicant intends to demolish is historic in age but was recorded as non-contributing in the Gunderson Historic District National Register Nomination.

Bryan Jones, homeowner, explained to the Commission that the garage has been neglected for many years and is not safe. The homeowner provided a letter from an architect confirming structural instability.

Motion by Commissioner Weidner to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Gurski

The Commission found no issue with the demolition as the garage was listed as a non-contributing resource. The Commission determined that the proposed new garage meets the New Building Policy.

Motion by Commissioner Jordahl to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of the existing garage and construction of a new garage as illustrated; Second by Commissioner Sokol; approved by Roll Call Vote as follows:

```
Bridge – yes
Sokol – yes
Gurski – yes
Weidner – yes
Jordahl – yes
Payne – yes
```

**C. HPC 2018-45: 614 Forest Ave (Montroy and Cusack):** Demolition of window and portion of wall to create new window left of existing window (Frank Lloyd Wright Prairie School Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application.

Planner Trexler presented the staff's report. She noted that the house has a 1993 addition at the rear and, while plans of the addition have not been located, the window indented for demolition was likely part of this 1993 addition. The new windows will also be within the 1993 addition.

Nancy Montroy and Dennis Cusack, homeowners, discussed the project and informed the Commission that the arched window seems to have been chosen to match 1993 kitchen cabinetry.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Jordahl

The Commission discussed the intended use of casement windows rather than sash windows. The homeowners explained the preference for casement due to ease of cleaning. The Commission expressed concern about the windows not matching the historic windows on the house. The homeowners explained that they match other windows on the addition. The Commission concluded that there was less concern as the windows will be added in an addition and are located on a secondary façade.

Motion by Commissioner Jordahl to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of the arched kitchen window and addition of two new windows as shown in submitted materials; Second by Commissioner Sokol; approved by Roll Call Vote as follows:

```
Bridge – yes
Sokol – yes
Gurski – yes
Weidner – yes
Jordahl – yes
Payne – yes
```

**D. HPC 2018-46: 821 N Euclid Ave (Faulkner):** Removal of existing wood slats on front porch. Addition of two decorative columns (Frank Lloyd Wright Prairie School Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application.

Planner Trexler presented the staff's report indicating the guidelines relevant for the application review.

Danielle Falknor, homeowner, provided information about the project and explained that the columns to be added are needed for structural support.

Motion by Commissioner Weidner to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Sokol

The Commission discussed the column design and whether it was appropriate in style for the house. The Commission discussed both the stylistic details and the material of the columns, which are to be added to a stucco house were proposed in wood.

Motion by Commissioner Gurski to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for removal of the existing wood slats and addition of columns with conditions that the columns are simple, wood columns painted to match the house, minimal in size, and with no cap or shoe.

Chair Payne recommended that some trim will be needed.

Gurksi withdrew motion

Motion by Commissioner Jordahl to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for removal of the existing wood slats and addition of columns with conditions that the columns are redesigned by the architect to be more sympathetic with the house and are approved by staff; Second by Commissioner Weidner; Approved by Roll Call Vote as follows:

```
Bridge – yes
Sokol – yes
```

```
Gurski – yes
Weidner – yes
Jordahl – yes
Payne – yes
```

**E. HPC 2018-47: 332 S Oak Park Ave (Washington):** Demolition of wall to accommodate five new windows and replacement of nine existing wood-framed windows (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application.

Planner Trexler presented the staff's report, noting that all new windows will be vinyl- or aluminum-clad wood.

Greg Williams, architect for the homeowner, described the project and noted that the windows are being added to meet the light and vent requirements as the basement is being converted into a living space.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Jordahl

The Commission agreed that the project meets the Architectural Review Guidelines.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of a portion of wall to accommodate five new windows and the replacement of nine existing windows as proposed; Second by Commissioner Weidner; Approved by Roll Call Vote as follows:

```
Bridge – yes
Sokol – yes
Gurski – yes
Weidner – yes
Jordahl – yes
Payne – yes
```

**F. HPC 2018-48: 303 N Marion St (Picchiotti):** Garage addition to house on corner lot, dormers to be added to second floor of house, and two porches added (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie Style of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application.

Planner Trexler presented the staff's report and noted that the applicant attended the October 24, 2018, Architectural Review Committee (ARC) meeting. She also explained that historical research has determined the location of the proposed front porch was a sleeping porch added in 1915. It was later enclosed and the applicant intends to reopen it into a porch.

Rick Schmidt, architect for the homeowner, described project changes following ARC meeting. He also informed the Commission that 303 N Marion St received a zoning variance to add the garage at the November 7, 2018, zoning meeting.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Jordahl

The Commission expressed approval that the project intends to repair historic siding, including decorative details recently uncovered. Commissioner Weidner asked about trim and material call-

outs and the architect replied that everything with be done in wood to match the historic siding, including the dormers, porch, and garage.

Motion by Commissioner Weidner to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the garage, dormer, and porch additions as proposed; Second by Commissioner Sokol; Approved by Roll Call Vote as follows:

```
Bridge – yes
Sokol – yes
Gurski – yes
Weidner – yes
Jordahl – yes
Payne – yes
```

**G. HPC 2018-49: 334 S Oak Park Ave (Knausenberger):** Add new basement entry at previous window location, construct sidewalk and privacy fence with gate (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application.

Planner Trexler presented the staff's report indicating the guidelines relevant for the application review. It was also noted that the applicant attended the October 24, 2018, ARC meeting.

Richard Chuck, architect for the homeowner, clarified that the project solely involves the creation of a basement-level entry at the location of an existing basement-level window.

Motion by Commissioner Weidner to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Bridge

The Commission expressed that the proposal meets the Architectural Review Guidelines.

Motion by Commissioner Weidner to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the basement-level door addition as proposed; Second by Commissioner Gurski; Approved by Roll Call Vote as follows:

```
Bridge – yes
Sokol – yes
Gurski – yes
Weidner – yes
Jordahl – yes
Payne – yes
```

**H. HPC 2018-50: 540 Gunderson Ave (Krupitzer):** Bathroom remodel including the demolition and relocation of existing window (Gunderson Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application.

Planner Trexler presented the staff's report and referenced the window policy from the Architectural Review Guidelines.

Romina Krupitzer, homeowner, explained that the project involves moving the window and that new window will be smaller. The awning window type was selected for easier maintenance.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Jordahl

The Commission expressed that there are no concerns with the proposed project.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the window demolition and addition as proposed; Second by Commissioner Bridge; Approved by Roll Call Vote as follows:

```
Bridge – yes
Sokol – yes
Gurski – yes
Weidner – yes
Jordahl – yes
Payne – yes
```

I. HPC 2018-51: 635 N Ridgeland Ave (Joslyn): Construction of two-story, rear addition, in line with existing house (Frank Lloyd Wright Prairie School Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application.

Planner Trexler presented the staff's report and referenced the addition policy from the Architectural Review Guidelines.

Steve Ryniewicz, architect for the homeowner, explained the project to the Commission.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Jordahl

The Commission expressed concern about the potential removal of the front door and asked if it will be repaired or replaced. The architect informed the Commission that the door will be repaired if possible and if not, it will be replaced in kind to match the existing door. Chair Payne noted that the scale of the addition and the use of the expansion joint to differentiate the addition comply with the addition guidelines.

Motion by Commissioner Bridge to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the addition as proposed with the condition that the door is repaired if possible and if not that it is replaced in kind; Second by Commissioner Weidner; Approved by Roll Call Vote as follows:

```
Bridge – yes
Sokol – yes
Gurski – yes
Weidner – yes
Jordahl – yes
Payne – yes
```

J. HPC 2018-52: 48 Washington Blvd (Gonzalez): Proposed demolition of historic windows on west side façade to raise sill height in apartment kitchens (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application.

Planner Trexler presented the staff's report and explained the window changes are being made to accommodate interior alterations.

Wilson Gonzalez, homeowner, presented the project to the staff and explained that the windows are too low for the proposed counters. The Commission requested confirmation that the new

#### **APPROVED** December 13, 2018

windows will be double-hung. The homeowner confirmed and presented a sample window to the Commission. The homeowner also confirmed that the sills will be reused and the gap will be filled with brick to match.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for window changes as proposed; Second by Commissioner Gurski; Approved by Roll Call Vote as follows:

Bridge – yes Sokol – yes Gurski – yes Weidner – yes Jordahl – yes Payne – yes

# **CONSENT AGENDA** - None

## **OTHER BUSINESS** - None

Motion by Commissioner Gurski to adjourn the meeting; Second by Commissioner Jordahl

#### **ADJOURN**

The meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Urban Planner Historic Preservation.