

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
October 11, 2018 - Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

A recording of this meeting is available on the Village of Oak Park Website: <https://www.oak-park.us/your-government/citizen-commissions/commission-tv>

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Christopher Payne, Tom Abrahamson, Jennifer Bridge, David Sokol, Noel Weidner, Sandra Carr and Rebecca Houze
ABSENT: Aleksandra Tadic, Laura Jordahl, Darrick Gurski,
STAFF: Craig Failor, AICP, Village Planner
ATTORNEY: Gregory Smith, Klein, Thorpe & Jenkins

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the agenda as amended; Second by Commissioner Abrahamson; Motion approved 7-0.

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT - None

MINUTES-

Motion by Commissioner Abrahamson to approve draft minutes for September 13, 2018; Second by Commissioner Weidner; Motion approved 7-0.

REGULAR AGENDA

- A. HPC 2018-41: 178 Forest Avenue (19th Century);** Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal and replacement of their iconic half round window. This property is a Landmark in the Frank Lloyd Wright Prairie School Historic District.

Village Planner Failor presented the staff's report indicating the various standards and guidelines relative for the application review. Mr. Failor detailed the proposal and the reason for HPC review.

Commissioner Sokol recused himself from this application as he is a member of the Association and sits on various committees.

Motion by Commissioner Weidner to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Abrahamson

Ms. Sarah Patton, Chair of the Building and Ground Committee for the 19th Century Charitable Association presented an overview of the proposal. She discussed the deterioration issues with the window and window frame. The committee felt the window was beyond repair. Ms. Jeanne Schultz Angel, Executive Director for the 19th Century Charitable Association provided additional information on the proposed replacement window. It was stated that the single pane window would be replaced with a aluminum clad wood double pane insulated window.

The Commission indicated they needed additional information which compared the dimensions of the existing window with that of the proposed window. The applicant indicated they will provide shop drawings of the window to staff for approval.

Motion by Commissioner Carr to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness pending staff approval on the window dimensions; Second by Commissioner Abrahamson; approved by a Roll Call Vote as follows:

Carr - yes
Abrahamson - yes
Bridge - yes
Houze - yes
Weidner - yes
Payne - yes

C. HPC 2018-43: 733 Woodbine Avenue (Gharavi): Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear and side addition. (Frank Lloyd Wright Prairie School Historic District).

Village Planner Failor presented the staff's report indicating the various standards and guidelines relative for the application review. Mr. Failor detailed the proposal and the reason for HPC review. He indicated that this item was reviewed by the Architectural Review Committee who indicated they would like to see a window on the front elevation of the new addition.

Motion by Commissioner Weidner to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Sokol

Mr. Lance Shalzi, Architect for the homeowner, provided an overview of the proposal. He indicated that the homeowner prefers to keep their interior kitchen design as proposed and not install a window on the front façade of the new addition. However, if it means they won't receive approval, it would be considered.

Commissioner Weidner found issue with the height of the addition as it is taller than the original house. Commissioner Houze found issue with the size of the addition as it was doubling the size of the original house. The Commission indicated that it would be helpful to see a rendering or isometric plan to determine the contextual application to the original house for both the height and massing. It was stated by other commissioners that due to the placement of the addition several feet beyond the original house face, the massing and height is not necessarily a concern. The concern agreed upon by all is that a window should be placed on the front façade of the new addition and that any mechanical appurtenances (e.g. hood exhaust) should not appear on the front façade. The size of the window (36") was discussed and agreed upon.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness; Second by Commissioner Bridge; a Roll Call Vote was taken as follows:

Sokol - yes
Bridge - yes
Abrahamson - yes
Carr - yes
Houze - no
Weidner - no
Payne - yes

The motion failed for lack of quorum of six (6) with a vote of 5-2. Based on the HPC's Rules of Procedure, the applicant can return to the next regularly scheduled meeting for another vote where absent members can vote in hopes of attaining a majority vote. The absent commissioners must watch the video of the missed meeting in advance. The vote will be a revote of the present commissioners. The other option is for the applicant to withdraw their application and resubmit with the modifications requested of the Commission.

D. HPC 2018-44: 614 N. East Avenue (Hartman): Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of a contributing garage. Construction of a new garage and residential rear addition. (Frank Lloyd Wright Prairie School Historic District).

This item was removed from the agenda per the request of the applicant. This item will appear on a future agenda.

E. HPC 2018-46: 410 Clinton Avenue (Eshenroder): Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of a slate roof and replacement with an asphalt roof. (Ridgeland / Oak Park Historic District).

Village Planner Failor presented the staff's report indicating the various standards and guidelines relative for the application review. Mr. Failor detailed the proposal and the reason for HPC review.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Weidner

The homeowners, Carrie Chapman and Huntely Eshendro presented an overview of their proposal. Ms. Chapman indicated that they would be open to other suggestions for asphalt shingle styles.

The Commission supported this application and recommended that they pursue a shingle that better matches the profile of the existing slate roof. The homeowners agreed. The Commission indicated that information should be provided to staff who shall confer with an ARC member on the final decision.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that the homeowner find a more appropriate shingle style matching the slate with staff and ARC member review and approval; Second by Commissioner Weidner; approved by Roll Call Vote as follows;

Abrahamson - yes

Bridge - yes

Carr - yes

Sokol - yes

Houze - yes

Weidner - yes

Payne - yes

B. HPC 2018-42: 834 N. Euclid Avenue: (Demos): Certificate of Appropriateness for removal of original front windows and front entry door. Front door to be relocated and window size reduced. (Ridgeland / Oak Park Historic District).

Village Planner Failor presented the staff's report indicating the various standards and guidelines relative for the application review. Mr. Failor detailed the proposal and the reason for HPC review.

Motion by Commissioner Carr to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Sokol

Mr. Errol Kirsh, architect for the homeowner, presented an overview of the application. He indicated that the interior remodel of adding a first floor bathroom which caused the exterior modifications was due to a need by the handicapped homeowner.

The commission discussed the need for window removal and replacement and creating a false doorway to keep the appearance of an entry door at its original location. It was suggested that the applicant look at creating a panel to apply to the exterior wall at the location of the existing entry door and that the window on the dining room wall not be removed.

Motion by Commissioner Carr to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that a panel is applied to the exterior wall at the location of the existing entry door and that the window on

the dining room wall is not removed. Staff shall review and approve the final plan; Second by Commissioner Sokol; approved by Roll Call Vote as follows;

Carr - yes
Sokol - yes
Abrahamson - yes
Bridge - yes
Houze - yes
Weidner - yes
Payne - yes

CONSENT AGENDA - None

OTHER BUSINESS

- Commission Abrahamson mentioned the *Architectural Finds Tent Sale* that will be held this weekend.
- Village Planner Failor introduced staff's new Urban Planner / Historic Preservation, Susie Trexler. Susie provided a brief overview of her education and work experience.

ADJOURN

The meeting adjourned at 8:50 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Craig Failor, Village Planner.