

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
April 12, 2018 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Jennifer Bridge, Sandra Carr, Darrick Gurski, Rebecca Houze, Laura Jordahl, Chair
Christopher Payne, David Sokol, Noel Weidner
ABSENT: Tom Abrahamson, Adam Engle, Aleksandra Tadic
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner; Craig Failor, AICP, Village Planner
ATTORNEY: Greg Smith, Klein, Thorpe & Jenkins

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Jordahl to approve the agenda as submitted. Second by Sokol. Motion approved 8-0.
AYE: Bridge, Carr, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Weidner, Chair Payne
NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

MINUTES

Motion by Carr to approve the March 8, 2018 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Sokol. Motion approved 8-0.
AYE: Bridge, Carr, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Weidner, Chair Payne
NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

- A. **HISTORIC LANDMARK: Public Hearing (Risch):**
- 400 N. Kenilworth Avenue: John J. Schmidt House (c. 1872-1908)
Property owners Dianne Risch was present.

Chair Payne opened the public hearing. He confirmed that written owner consent is on file with the Village.

Commissioner Gurski stated that he lives within the 250-foot radius of the property and received the public hearing notice. He stated that he can remain fair and impartial when voting on the nomination.

Motion by Sokol to approve the nomination report as the Findings of Fact. Second by Bridge.

Planner Kaarre read the list of exhibits into the record. Exhibit A is the Nomination Form and Exhibit B is the Nomination Report.

Dianne Risch, property owner of 400 N. Kenilworth, stated that she had nothing to add in addition to the nomination report.

There was no testimony in support or opposition to the nomination.

Commissioner Sokol stated that most of the points were made at the preliminary eligibility meeting. The nomination was well-prepared and he supports the nomination.

Commissioner Houze stated that it is an interesting nomination and she appreciates how far back the history of the property is outlined. She supports the nomination.

Chair Payne concurred. He appreciates how well-maintained a house of this age is. The property is well cared for.

Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Bridge, Carr, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

Motion by Weidner to forward a Resolution with the Findings of Fact for the John J. Schmidt House, located at 400 N. Kenilworth Avenue, to the Village Board for approval. Second by Bridge. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Bridge, Carr, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

Motion by Sokol to close the public hearing. Second by Bridge. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Bridge, Carr, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

- B. **HPC 2018-11: 741 Fair Oaks Avenue (Clink)**: Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the original slate roof on the house with asphalt shingles and repair the copper inlaid gutters (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)
Property owner Matthew Clink was present.

Planner Kaarre presented the staff report. The *The Otto L. Toll House* was constructed in 1912 and designed in the Tudor Revival style by architects White & Christie. The existing slate roof is over 100 years old, and may have reached the end of its useful life. Photos of the existing slate show that there is significant delamination. The copper inlaid gutters also appear worn and damaged. The proposal is to remove the slate roof from the house and replace with a GAF Slateline asphalt shingle. The proposal also includes the repair of the inlaid copper gutters and replacement of the gutter liners. The slate roof on the garage is not proposed for replacement. The owners have submitted three bids for replacement with slate, replacement with stone and replacement with asphalt, showing that new slate is not economically feasible. The Guidelines also state that the replacement shingle must match "as closely as possible" the historic slate roofing material in size, profile, color and texture. The *Weathered Slate* from GAF Slateline does not meet this Guideline, although it is a similar color. The current slate tiles are horizontal in shape, while the proposed asphalt shingles are more the size of a wood shingle. Staff recommends approval subject to finding a more appropriate replacement shingle.

Motion by Jordahl to open the item for discussion. Second by Houze.

Commissioner Weidner stated that it was not as large a cost difference as they have seen for other houses, plus the asphalt only has a 25-year warranty. He wondered if that had been considered.

Matthew Clink noted that they understood that, but they repaired the slate roof a few years ago, and would like to demolish the coach house in the future, so they are considering the overall long-term costs.

Commissioner Jordahl asked the life expectancy of slate.

Matthew Clink stated it was 100 years.

Chair Payne stated that the biggest issue is the difference in appearance between the existing historic slate (rectangular) and the proposed asphalt shingles (square). The owner should do more research to find an asphalt shingle that matches more closely in dimension, appearance and color. There is no issue with the gutter restoration.

Motion by Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 741 Fair Oaks Avenue subject to staff approval of the final asphalt shingle selection. Second by Jordahl. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Bridge, Carr, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

CONSENT AGENDA

None

OTHER BUSINESS

Traditional Building Conference: This conference is being held at the Nineteenth Century Club in Oak Park on April 24-25. Everyone is encouraged to attend using the IAHPD discount.

NAPC Forum: This conference of the National Alliance of Preservation Commission is being held in Des Moines, Iowa on July 18-22.

Oak Park Guide Book: Discussion of the guide book sections, formatting and bibliography.

Commissioner Weidner will take Madison Street and Commissioner Jordahl the Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District. Chair Payne provided an overview for moving forward.

A Day in Our Village: If you are interested in representing the HPC along with the Housing and Community Development commissions, contact staff.

Approved Projects Update: Planner Kaarre provided before/after photos of previously approved projects that have recently been completed.

ADJOURN

Motion by Sokol to adjourn. Second by Weidner. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Bridge, Carr, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

The meeting adjourned at 8:30 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner.