

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
March 8, 2018 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Tom Abrahamson, Jennifer Bridge, Sandra Carr, Adam Engle, Darrick Gurski, Rebecca Houze, Acting Chair Laura Jordahl, David Sokol, Aleksandra Tadic
ABSENT: Chair Christopher Payne, Noel Weidner
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner
ATTORNEY: Greg Smith, Klein, Thorpe & Jenkins

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Abrahamson to approve the agenda as submitted. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 9-0.
AYE: Abrahamson, Bridge, Carr, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Sokol, Tadic, Acting Chair Jordahl
NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

MINUTES

Motion by Sokol to approve the February 8, 2018 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Engle. Motion approved 9-0.
AYE: Abrahamson, Bridge, Carr, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Sokol, Tadic, Acting Chair Jordahl
NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

- A. **HISTORIC LANDMARK: Preliminary Determination of Eligibility (Risch):**
- 400 N. Kenilworth Avenue: John J. Schmidt House (c. 1872-1908)
The property owners were not present.

Planner Kaarre presented the staff report and provided an overview of the nomination. The property was constructed c. 1872 for John J. Schmidt and was altered in 1908 with a new front porch, side addition, as well as interior changes. The 1908 design was by architect E. E. Roberts. The property is proposed to meet four criteria for designation and staff recommends approval.

Motion by Engle to open the item for discussion. Second by Abrahamson.

Commissioner Bridge stated that she appreciated all of the details in the nomination report and the overview of the changes to the building over time.

Commissioner Houze stated that it has interesting cultural and architectural history.

The commission discussed the nomination and agreed that the property meets four criteria for designation.

Motion by Sokol to approve the preliminary determination of eligibility for the Historic Landmark nomination of 400 N. Kenilworth Avenue under criteria (1), (3), (5) and (6). Second by Engle. Motion approved 9-0.
AYE: Abrahamson, Bridge, Carr, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Sokol, Tadic, Acting Chair Jordahl
NAY: None

- B. **HPC 2018-07: 201 S. Scoville Avenue (Miller)**: Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the original front and rear shed dormers with larger shed dormers to match the roof slope and materials (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*)
Property owner Amanda Miller was present.

Planner Kaarre presented the staff report. The house was constructed in 1904 and is a contributing resource in the historic district. The proposal is to replace the original front and rear dormers and replace them with new larger dormers, match the roof slope and materials. The ARC noted that the existing dormers appear to be unusually small. While the new dormers will be very visible from the street, and will slightly change the scale, they meet most of the guidelines found in the New Addition Policy in regards to dormer design, setback, character and materials. They recommended that the applicant provide additional information on how the increased size of the dormer is in keeping with the character of the house and neighborhood context. The applicants provided information on additional front dormers on the block. The proposed dormers appear to meet the New Addition Policy of the Guidelines as they are compatible with the house in size, scale, design, set-back, massing, material, placement and character. They do not remove significant character-defining features, and while significantly larger than the existing dormers, they are compatible with the style and historic character of the house. Staff is recommending approval of the application as submitted.

Amanda Miller stated that the proposed dormers maintain the character of the home and are smaller than half the roof area as allowed in the Guidelines. The materials and roof slope will match, and the scale is more in keeping with other homes on the block.

Motion by Sokol to open the item for discussion. Second by Bridge.

Commissioner Sokol stated that it was a sensitive and realistic solution.

Commissioner Jordahl agreed that the scale was in keeping with other dormers on the street.

The commission discussed the proposal and agreed that the dormers meet the Architectural Review Guidelines.

Motion by Abrahamson to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 201 S. Scoville Avenue to construct new front and rear dormers as submitted. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Abrahamson, Bridge, Carr, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Sokol, Tadic, Acting Chair Jordahl
NAY: None

- C. **HPC 2018-08: 312 S. Kenilworth Avenue (Murphy)**: Certificate of Appropriateness to alter front door opening, restore front porch design and alter side window openings (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*)
Property owner Jim Murphy and project designer Caren Isopo were present.

Planner Kaarre presented the staff report. The brick Chicago-style two-flat was constructed in 1906 by masonry contractors and developers Harper & Butendorff. They also constructed the adjacent property at 310 S. Kenilworth. Both properties are Contributing Resources in the historic district. The applicants are converting the two-flat into a single-family home and are proposing to enclose the north front door opening, alter window openings on the sides, and restore the front porch based on the adjacent property. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application as submitted with the recommendation to infill the north door opening with a full-width sidelight panel rather than a half-width sidelight and Hardie board panel.

Caren Isopo, Safe & Sound Investments, provided an overview of the application. The proposed door design intent will utilize the existing openings. The original proposal was to infill the left side panel with a custom designed solid wood paneled insert that will feature a sidelight. She has provided a second option based on recommendation of the Architectural Review Committee which proposes a full-width window above the banding with a panel below. The design intent is that the panel will be treated wood that will be finished to match the brick color. The section that is to function as a window will then match the door finish and repeat the glass mullion design. The panel insert will also feature a detail that honor the façade design and will capture horizontal detail to align with that of the existing brick course detail. The repair/renovation proposed for the front porch will match the adjacent structure at 310 S. Kenilworth.

Motion by Abrahamson to open the item for discussion. Second by Houze.

Commissioner Tadic stated that she supports the second door option as it maintains the opening, is proportional and utilizes the horizontal band.

The commission discussed the proposal to alter some side window openings, restore the front porch and alter one door opening and agreed that the scope of work, incorporating the front door option 2, meets the Architectural Review Guidelines.

Motion by Carr to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 312 S. Kenilworth Avenue to alter the front door opening, restore the front porch design and alter the side window openings with the condition that Option 2 be used for the front door. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Abrahamson, Bridge, Carr, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Sokol, Tadic, Acting Chair Jordahl

NAY: None

- D. **HPC 2018-09: 205 Superior Street (Scholtens):** Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a rear bay and construct a rear one-story addition, and alter rear/side second-floor window openings (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*)
Property owner William Scholtens was present.

Planner Kaarre presented the staff report. The house was constructed in 1911 by contractors C. F. Helman for owner N. Nicopoulos. The property is a Contributing Resources in the historic district. The proposal involves removing a non-historic one-story bay window from the rear and constructing a one-story brick addition. The addition will have a flat roof with brick and wood panels, and will be small in scale. Also proposed is the alteration of the window openings on the rear second-floor sun porch. The existing wood windows are not original, although there are no permits to date the construction of this porch. The proposed new openings will use the same window sizes with wood panels between and a similar muntin pattern. The addition and window alterations meet the Guidelines as proposed. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application as submitted to demolish the rear one-story bay, construct a rear one-story brick addition, and alter window openings on the rear second-floor sun porch as submitted.

William Scholtens stated the date of the existing addition is not known, though it is clearly not original as the construction does not fit the existing character of the home with lap siding, pre-manufactured bay window and roof extension. The replacement addition features a single-story form and utilizes a material palette in keeping with the character of the original home: original brick re-used for the base, limestone grade band detail to match original, a composition of white painted wood panel and window, beaded board ceiling, and a copper roof edge detail. The new 1-story addition retains all significant character defining features of the original home, the 1-story form is submissive to the large home and therefore is appropriate in massing, size, and scale. The addition

does not change the historic façade of the original building. A visual distinction is made to protect the historic significance as the character is slightly more modern, and the roof line is set lower than the existing roof line, which will be restored. The second floor windows will replace windows not original to the home. It is believed this space was originally a sleeping porch. No permits or drawings exist. The new windows continue the character with raised painted white wood panel and white colored alum wood windows by Marvin. The upper sash feature divided light sash over a single lite to continue the portion and scale of the windows.

Motion by Sokol to open the item for discussion. Second by Engle.

The commission discussed the proposed rear addition and rear second-floor window alterations and agreed that the proposal meets the Architectural Review Guidelines.

Motion by Engle to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 205 Superior Street to construct a rear one-story addition and alter second-floor window openings as submitted. Second by Sokol. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Abrahamson, Bridge, Carr, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Sokol, Tadic, Acting Chair Jordahl

NAY: None

CONSENT AGENDA

None

OTHER BUSINESS

Deconstruction Laws: Commissioner Abrahamson noted that in the latest edition of The Alliance Review from the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions there was an article about a law in Portland, Oregon requiring that certain properties that are demolished are to be deconstructed for reuse. This sounds like something that might be worth investigating in Oak Park for both preservation and environmental reasons. The commission discussed and noted that there are numerous companies around Chicago that accept reusable construction materials. Planner Kaarre noted that there is nothing like that in place in Oak Park. He can approach the Sustainability Coordinator to see if she would be interested in looking at this option further. Any work on this subject moving forward would require Board approval to amend the 2018 HPC work plan.

HPC Education Committee: Acting Chair asked if there was any update on reinstating the Education Committee. Planner Kaarre stated that approval was recently given to move forward with requesting Board approval to amend the preservation ordinance and add the language to create the committee. It was also suggested that the HPC consider combining the Architectural Review Committee with the Education Committee. The ARC discussed this and did not feel that would be useful. This will be looked into further. Commissioner Sokol noted that one of the reasons for the committees is to better utilize that backgrounds of all the commissioners. Combining them would create a “committee of the whole.” Planner Kaarre stated that the concern was the HPC having too many monthly meetings.

ADJOURN

Motion by Engle to adjourn. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Abrahamson, Bridge, Carr, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Sokol, Tadic, Acting Chair Jordahl

NAY: None

The meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner.