

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
December 14, 2017 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Christopher Payne, Jennifer Bridge, Sandra Carr, Darrick Gurski, Rebecca Houze, Laura Jordahl, David Sokol
ABSENT: Adam Engle, Aleksandra Tadic, Noel Weidner
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner
ATTORNEY: Greg Smith, Klein, Thorpe & Jenkins

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Sokol to approve the agenda as submitted. Second by Bridge. Motion approved 7-0.
AYE: Bridge, Carr, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Chair Payne
NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

MINUTES

Motion by Jordahl to approve the November 9, 2017 meeting minutes as amended. Second by Carr. Motion approved 7-0.
AYE: Bridge, Carr, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Chair Payne
NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

- A. **HPC 2017-54: 114 S. Kenilworth Avenue (Baronger Development/Goldstein):** Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the front porch second floor, replace windows and siding (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*)
Ron McEachen was present representing the property owner.

Planner Kaarre provided the staff report. The house was constructed c. 1890. There are no original permits on file, though the building does appear on the 1895 Sanborn Fire Insurance map. It is a Contributing Resource within the *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*. The proposal is to completely rehab the building and to convert it back to a single-family house. The asphalt siding will be removed and the original wood siding restored. Portions were uncovered and are in excellent condition. The wood 1/1 double-hung windows will be replaced with fiberglass or clad-wood windows. The decorative window casing will be replaced with new casing. Several window openings will be removed and replaced with new ones. The 2nd-story porch, which was constructed in 1921, will be removed and a new roof constructed over the existing first floor porch (minus the additional staircase, which will be removed). Finally, a new asphalt shingle roof will be added.

Much of the window casing/trim has decorative details including horizontal and vertical lines in triplicate, and bulls-eye motif at corners. This original trim should be retained and repaired as original architectural features of the house. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application subject to the retention of the historic window casings, per Section 7-9-13(E) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. The proposal meets the Architectural Review Guidelines as the new windows are compatible with the size, scale and architecture of the building.

Motion by Sokol to open the application for discussion. Second by Jordahl.

The applicant met with the Architectural Review Committee on August 23 and November 29, 2017. The Commission discussed the proposal and noted that it would be a welcome improvement. The decorative window trim was discussed, which is found on front and some windows on the side. Mr. McEachen replied that if decorative trim needs to be replaced, it will match existing.

Motion by Jordahl to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 114 S. Kenilworth Avenue to demolish the front porch second floor, remove the second-floor stairs from the front porch, replace non-decorative windows, remove the asphalt siding and repair the original wood siding, and restore the decorative trim, per plans received on December 8, 2017. Second by Sokol.

Commissioner Abrahamson arrived at 7:40 p.m.

Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Bridge, Carr, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Chair Payne

NAY: None

- B. **HPC 2017-71: 528 N. Marion Street (Jackson)**: Certificate of Appropriateness to remove two front doors and replace with one double door (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)
Property owner Liane Jackson and architect Jeanna DiMaria were present.

Planner Kaarre provided the staff report. The house was constructed c. 1897. It is a Contributing Resource within the *Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*. The house was converted to a two-family building prior to 1942, the earliest documentation on file. The owner is currently converting the building back to a single-family house. The proposal is to remove the two separate entry doors on the front porch and add a double door opening in roughly the same location. The new door will include a transom window above and glass side lights on both sides.

Adding a double-door configuration with side lights and transom window to this Queen Anne house, while not common in the style, is not incompatible with the character. Although double doors are most common in the Italianate style, and side lights most common in the Colonial Revival style, there are examples of the combination on some grander Queen Anne houses. However, in every example the transom windows are also above the side lights, and the door configuration is a single door. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application to create a new double-door entry with transom and side lights to replace the existing doors pending the addition of two transom windows above the side lights and the consideration of reducing the doors to one, per Section 7-9-13(E) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. The proposal meets the Architectural Review Guidelines as amended.

Jeanna DiMaria noted that the proposal will remain within the rough opening of the existing two doors.

Motion by Carr to open the application for discussion. Second by Houze.

The Commission discussed the application and agreed that the proposal was a reasonable solution and compatible with the style of the house.

Motion by Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 528 N. Marion Street to replace the front doors with the condition that a single door be used with sidelights and transom windows above, rather than two doors. Second by Bridge. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Abrahamson, Bridge, Carr, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Chair Payne

NAY: None

- C. **HPC 2017-72: 515 South Boulevard (Daley)**: Certificate of Appropriateness to create basement window openings on the front and side elevations (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*)
Architect Debra McQueen was present.

Planner Kaarre provided an overview of the application. The apartment building was constructed c. 1900 and is a Contributing Resource within the *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*. The proposal is to convert the basement into an apartment and other usable space. Additional windows are required by code, and two fixed basement window openings will be created to flank the front porch, centered under the first floor windows. An additional pair of operable casement basement windows will be added on the west façade near the front. The new windows on the east will not currently be visible from the street. All windows will be “Marvin Integrity All Ultrex” fiberglass windows. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application per Section 7-9-13(E) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. The proposal meets the Architectural Review Guidelines as the new windows are compatible with the size, scale and architecture of the building.

Motion by Jordahl to open the application for discussion. Second by Houze.

The Commission discussed the proposal and determined that it meets the Window Policy of the Architectural Review Guidelines as long as the new windows are recessed to match the existing windows.

Motion by Abrahamson to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 515 South Boulevard to create basement window openings on the front and side elevations as submitted. Second by Jordahl. Motion approved 8-0.

*AYE: Abrahamson, Bridge, Carr, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Chair Payne
NAY: None*

- D. **Architectural Review Guidelines**: Finalize list of changes from the existing guidelines.

Chair Payne noted that they are reviewing substantive changes between the existing and proposed guidelines. The Commission discussed the following:

- The articulation in the proposed guidelines is stronger in regards to not allowing historic materials to be covered with artificial siding.
- The proposed guidelines do not mention the replacement of non-original windows. It should state that the new design should be based on existing or documented historic windows.
- A replacement roof can be replaced with any new material. When the original roof is replaced to maintain the appearance of the original, then it becomes a new roof and in the future could be replaced with any new material. The guidelines interpretation should require the appearance to be maintained.
- The Commission discussed the review procedures for Certificates of Appropriateness and Advisory Review.
- Garage guidelines are now part of the New Construction and Additions section.
- While floor additions are still allowed, they are required to be set back and may not extend the full floor.
- The format of the guidelines has significantly changed.
- It was suggested to make the document searchable on-line at some point.
- The solar panel sheet includes a new process.

CONSENT AGENDA

None

OTHER BUSINESS

Chair Payne introduced new commission member Tom Abrahamson. Tom provided an overview of his background and interests. The commission members introduced themselves.

The funding for the new guide book has been removed for 2018 due to budget cuts. Also, the Preservation Awards ceremony may no longer be held off of Village property and may not be catered.

Chair Payne will prepare a letter to the Village Board requesting their authorization to amend the historic preservation ordinance to allow the commission to create committees.

ADJOURN

Motion by Abrahamson to adjourn. Second by Jordahl. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Abrahamson, Bridge, Carr, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Chair Payne

NAY: None

The meeting adjourned at 9:25 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner.