

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
November 9, 2017 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Christopher Payne, Jennifer Bridge, Adam Engle, Darrick Gurski, Rebecca Houze, Laura Jordahl, David Sokol, Aleksandra Tadic, Noel Weidner
ABSENT: Sandra Carr
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner
ATTORNEY: Greg Smith, Klein, Thorpe & Jenkins

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Tadic to approve the agenda as submitted. Second by Jordahl. Motion approved 6-0.
AYE: Bridge, Carr, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Chair Payne
NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

MINUTES

Commissioners Jordahl and Sokol provided amendments to the minutes.

Motion by Bridge to approve the September 14, 2017 meeting minutes as amended. Second by Carr. Motion approved 6-0.
AYE: Bridge, Carr, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Chair Payne
NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

- A. **HISTORIC LANDMARK: Public Hearing (Ryan)**
- 414 Augusta Street: *Edgar Rice Burroughs House no. 1 (1911-1912)*

Chair Payne opened the public hearing. He noted that the owner consent is on file with the Village.

Motion by Sokol to accept the nomination report for 414 Augusta Street as the Findings of Fact. Second by Bridge.

Planner Kaarre read the list of exhibits into the record.

Property owner Peter Ryan was present and thanked staff for their work on the nomination.

There was no testimony in support or opposition to the nomination.

Motion approved 9-0.
AYE: Bridge, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne
NAY: None

Motion by Engle to forward a Resolution with the Findings of Fact for the Edgar Rice Burroughs House no. 1, located at 414 Augusta Street, to the Village Board for approval. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 9-0.
AYE: Bridge, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

- B. **HPC 2017-52: 316 Washington Boulevard (Fox Partners LP):** Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement on front façade of fire-damaged apartment building (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*)
Property owner Mike Fox and architect Kelby Phillips were present.

Mike Fox, Fox Partners LP, stated that they had a fire in the building and they are redesigning the floor layouts. This requires additional egress windows on the sides. The front bay windows are art glass. They have enough art glass windows from the sides to use on the front. They will salvage all of the transom windows, but are short a few.

Motion by Jordahl to open the application for discussion. Second by Bridge.

The applicant met with the Architectural Review Committee on July 26 and September 27, 2017. The Commission discussed the proposal and agreed with retaining and repairing the front art glass windows, and front/side transom windows and allowing the side art glass casement windows to be replaced with sliding fiberglass windows to simulate the original design.

Motion by Weidner to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 316 Washington Boulevard to replace the side art glass windows with fiberglass to simulate the original in order to meet egress requirements, and to retain and repair the front casements and front/side transom windows. Second by Sokol. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Bridge, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

- C. **HPC 2017-66: 834 Columbian Avenue (Durgin/Troolin):** Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the front sun porch and replace with matching new porch (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)
Property owner Patrick Durgin was present.

Planner Kaarre provided an overview of the application. The proposal is to demolish the one-story stucco sun porch on the front of the house due to structural issues and rebuild it to match the existing materials and appearance. The applicant met with the Architectural Review Committee on May 30, 2017. The committee agreed that the project met the Guidelines and recommends approval. Staff recommends approval as submitted.

Motion by Sokol to open the application for discussion. Second by Bridge.

The Commission discussed the application and agreed that the proposal was a reasonable solution.

Motion by Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 834 Columbian to demolish the front sun porch and replace with matching new porch. Second by Jordahl. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Bridge, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

- D. **HPC 2017-67: 740 N. Kenilworth Avenue (Castonguay/Feeley):** Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear two-story addition (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)
Property owner Barb Feeley and architect Kim Smith were present.

Planner Kaarre provided an overview of the application. The proposal is to construct a rear two-story frame addition to match the existing materials and appearance. The addition is compatible with the

house in size, scale, materials, location and setback. Although the addition is flush with the side walls, delineation is created by utilizing a lower roof height than the main roof. The proposal also includes the removal of two windows – one on each side at the rear. These alterations are minimal in scope and will not alter the character of the house. Staff recommends approval as submitted.

Motion by Jordahl to open the application for discussion. Second by Tadic.

The Commission discussed the proposal and determined that it meets the New Addition Policy of the Architectural Review Guidelines.

Motion by Jordahl to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 740 N. Kenilworth to construct a rear two-story addition as submitted. Second by Weidner. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Bridge, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

- E. **HPC 2017-68: 734 S. Elmwood Avenue (Pierce)**: Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a one-story garage and construct a two-story garage (*Gunderson Historic District*)
Property owner Rob Pierce was present.

Planner Kaarre provided an overview of the application. The proposal is to demolish the one-story frame garage and construct a two-story frame garage. The garage is in deteriorated condition and the owner wishes to expand to two floors. Rehab estimates were compared with new construction cost. The new garage will be a two-story frame garage with gable roof and siding to match the house. The applicant met with the Architectural Review Committee on Sept. 27, 2017. The committee noted that it would be supportive pending the submittal of a condition assessment report and cost comparisons, as well as some design alterations to the new garage, such as wider eaves, compatible siding and roof slope, all of which were incorporated into the new design. Staff recommends approval as submitted.

Motion by Bridge to open the application for discussion. Second by Engle.

The Commission discussed the proposal. The siding on the house is 12-inch asbestos siding. The Commission recommended matching the original siding underneath so that it would match should the house be restored in the future. They discussed the roof slope and roofing materials.

Motion by Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 734 S. Elmwood to demolish the one-story garage and construct a two-story garage with the following conditions:

- *The roofing material should match the roofing material of the house.*
- *The siding on the new garage shall be 3-inch wood clapboard siding to match the original siding underneath the asphalt/asbestos siding on the house.*

Second by Tadic. Motion approved 8-1.

AYE: Bridge, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Weidner

NAY: Chair Payne

- F. **HPC 2017-69: 618 S. Elmwood Avenue (Nelligan)**: Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the second-floor wood shingles and install fiber cement board shingles (*Gunderson Historic District*)
Property owners Meg and Brendan Nelligan were present.

Planner Kaarre provided an overview of the application. The proposal is to remove the second-floor wood shingles, which are seriously deteriorated, and install James Hardie fiber cement shingles

(straight edge). The owners submitted cost estimates for new cedar, vinyl and fiber cement board, and they were all similar. Staff recommends approval of the application subject to the change to cedar shingles.

Meg Nelligan stated that the look is important to them. The cost for cedar would be higher because there is a \$5,000-6,000 cost to stain and seal, and then repeat every 5-6 years. Fiber cement board has a 20-30 year guarantee on color, and no maintenance. It would only be the second floor and would look the same.

Motion by Jordahl to open the application for discussion. Second by Bridge.

The Commission discussed the application. Use of fiber cement board would eliminate the mitered corners, which is a significant element of the design and would impact the character of the house. The Guidelines are clear that the replacement material should match unless economically not feasible. This would be very visible from the street. The additional costs for long-term maintenance are not applicable to the cost comparisons.

Meg Nelligan stated that she understands she can go over the material with something else and it's hard to understand the difference

Chair Payne explained the definition of demolition in the preservation ordinance. Covering an original material could preserve it, as long as it doesn't damage it. He discussed technical infeasibility vs. appearance. Visually there is a much greater difference between fiber cement and cedar. Maintenance is a normal cost of owning a home and not within their purview.

Brendan Nelligan stated that most of the shingles are bad. They have had several people look at them. It would be too difficult to retain and repair those that are good as they are spread out.

Chair Payne noted that wood shingles can be pre-treated and pre-stained which extends their warranty and cuts down on maintenance.

Motion by Weidner to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 618 S. Elmwood to replace the wood shingles on the second floor, with the following condition:

- *The new shingles shall be wood shingles to match the existing in size and material.*

Second by Engle. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Bridge, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

G. **HPC 2017-64: 151 N. Harvey Avenue (Meyerson)**: Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a one-story stucco garage and construct a one-story frame/vinyl garage (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*)

The property owner was unable to be present.

Planner Kaarre introduced the application. The proposal is to demolish the deteriorated one-story frame/stucco garage and construct a new one-story vinyl-clad frame garage similar in size and location. Although the garage is located on an alley, the garage doors face the street. The house is clad in vinyl. The applicant met with the Architectural Review Committee on October 25, 2017. The committee agreed that the project met the Guidelines and recommends approval. Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.

Motion by Sokol to open the application for discussion. Second by Weidner.

The Commission discussed the change in siding from stucco to vinyl.

Motion by Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 740 N. Kenilworth to demolish a one-story stucco garage and construct a one-story frame/vinyl garage as submitted. Second by Weidner. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Bridge, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

CONSENT AGENDA

None

OTHER BUSINESS

There will be an upcoming educational workshop in Evanston through the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions. More information will follow.

The annual meeting of the Illinois Association of Historic Preservation Commissions will be held in Riverside on Saturday, Dec. 2. The event will include presentations on fiber cement board siding, alternative roofing materials, 2017 Commission Excellence Awards and more. The meeting is co-sponsored with the Chicago Suburban Preservation Alliance.

ADJOURN

Motion by Engle to adjourn. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Bridge, Engle, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

The meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner.