

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
April 13, 2017 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers – Room 201, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Christopher Payne, Greg Battoglia, Jennifer Bridge, Darrick Gurski, Rebecca Houze, Laura Jordahl, Don McLean, Aleksandra Tadic, Noel Weidner
ABSENT: Dan Moroney, David Sokol
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Battoglia to approve the agenda as submitted. Second by Jordahl. Motion approved 9-0.
AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, McLean, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne
NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

MINUTES

Motion by Jordahl to approve the minutes of the March 9, 2017 meeting as submitted. Second by Weidner. Motion approved 8-0.
AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, McLean, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne
NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

- A. **HISTORIC LANDMARK: Preliminary Determination of Eligibility**
209 Forest Avenue: James T. Hayden House (William K Johnston, 1893)
Property owner Holly Van Deursen was present.

Planner Kaarre provided the staff report. The Hayden House is an excellent example of the Queen Anne style of architecture and is significant for its association with James T. Hayden, an executive with the Crane Company, a manufacturer of steam powered engines and elevators, and with architect William K. Johnston, a Canadian architect who authored a plan book, and worked in the Midwest region with his home and office in Chicago. Staff recommends that the property meets Criteria 3, 5 and 6 for designation.

Commissioner Weidner asked if it was also in a historic district.

Planner Kaarre stated yes, it was in the Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District.

Commissioner Battoglia stated that it clearly qualifies.

Chair Payne concurs that it meets three criteria for designation.

Motion by Battoglia that the property at 209 Forest Avenue is eligible for Historic Landmark designation under criteria (3) (5) and (6) as presented in the Nomination Report. Second by McLean. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, McLean, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne
NAY: None

- B. **HPC 2017-19: 114 S. Euclid Avenue (Tomlinson): Certificate of Appropriateness to replace 14 wood double-hung windows and 2 decorative diamond pane windows with vinyl windows (Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District)**
The property owner was not present.

Planner Kaarre provided the staff report. The house at 114 S. Euclid is a Contributing Resource within the *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*. The house was constructed c. 1890. A total of 16 historic wood windows were replaced with vinyl windows without a building permit or Certificate of Appropriateness. The applicant, Power Home Remodeling, applied for a permit to replace 12 windows and was told they needed a COA. A month later they amended their application to add 4 more windows, and were again told via letter by email they needed a COA. Several days later the owner called to say the work had already been done, and that she thought the contractor had the permit.

The contractor, Power Home Remodeling, stated that they waited a month for the permit but heard nothing back, so went ahead and installed the windows, assuming that the permit would eventually come, not realizing the house was in a historic district. 14 of the windows that were replaced were 1/1 double-hung windows; the other two were decorative diamond paned fixed windows. The contractors used a higher-end vinyl window, and the Guidelines state that for simple 1/1 sash replacement, the material does not have to match the original. Therefore, staff recommends approve the replacement of the double-hung windows, but requiring that the two decorative windows be replaced with wood true-divided light windows to match the original windows.

The Commission discussed their enforcement capabilities for historic wood window replacement. A Certificate of Appropriateness is required for the replacement of historic windows that are visible from the street, because the removal of historic windows is considered by the Commission to be demolition.

The Commission discussed the vinyl window that was used by the contractor Power Home Remodeling. It had a European bevel rather than a flat edge. There was consensus that it was okay to leave the 1/1 windows in place based on what was used and what is stated in the Guidelines.

Commissioner Weidner stated that the historic preservation ordinance Section 7-9-20 on enforcement allows the Village to ban contractors from working in the Village for up to a year.

Commissioner Jordahl stated that the contractor noted in their letter that this type of procedure was routine for them before getting a permit. They should let the Village know and find out if other contractors do this too.

Commissioner Battoglia stated that there are also life/safety issues. He agrees they should request a work ban of some length of time.

Commissioner Gurski suggested they have some education of window companies.

Chair Payne suggested that the Education Committee be tasked with that. The Window Policy in the Architectural Review Guidelines stated that windows may be replaced if repair is technically infeasible and the new windows are compatible. He agrees with the staff report. It makes no sense to pull all of these windows. The decorative windows need to be held to a higher standard. He agrees they should be replicated and put back.

April 113, 2017 minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

Commissioner Houze stated that she is concerned about the precedent for accepting these vinyl replacement windows since they are already in place. What is more costly?

Commissioner Battoglia stated that replacing non-ornamental sash still meets the Guidelines.

Chair Payne asked if it would be feasible to put wood windows back. They'll look similar but would not be historic.

Motion by Gurski to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement at 114 S. Euclid Avenue with the following conditions:

- *The fourteen vinyl replacement sash may remain in place as the window that was used had a European beveled edge and the brick molding was not capped. Also, the Architectural Review Guidelines indicate that as the window that was removed was a non-ornamental 1-over-1 sash, the replacement window does not have to replicate the material.*
- *The two diamond-paned windows above the front entrance on the second floor shall be replicated with true-divided light wood windows to match those that were removed. The Architectural Review Guidelines indicate that historic decorative windows shall be repaired rather than replaced.*

Second by Tadic. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, McLean, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

Motion by Jordahl to notify the proper Village staff about Power Home Remodeling's history of completing work before receiving their permit. Second by Battoglia. Motion approved. 9-0.

Chair Payne doesn't feel that it meets the threshold for banning the contractor to work in the Village, but if this type of work pattern continues in the future, he would recommend looking into it.

AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, McLean, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

C. **HPC 2017-21: 115 S. Harvey Avenue (Boehm): Advisory Review to construct a rear one-story, two-car garage (Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District)**

Property owner Jake Boehm was present

Planner Kaarre provided the staff report. The Historic Preservation Commission approved a Certificate of Appropriateness application to demolish the rear two-story coach house at its meeting on March 9, 2017. On March 28, 2017 the applicants submitted the plans for a new one-story frame garage to replace the coach house. The garage will be located in the same location at the rear of the lot. The building will have a gable end facing east-west and will be clad with vinyl siding and smart lap trim board. The house and former coach house have hipped roofs, and the proposed gabled roof is not a compatible roof profile historically on the site. This leads to the design of the garage which is not compatible with the design of the house, due mainly to the fact that the roof is not hipped. The details that stand out are the shallow-pitched roof, frieze board and boxed eave returns, as well as the vinyl siding. The project as proposed does not appear to meet the Garage Policy and Staff recommends that the Commission support changes to the garage that meet the Guidelines.

Jake Boehm, property owner, stated that the drawing is not to scale and the roof looks shallower than the pitch. They wanted a gable for storage and are matching the gable on the front dormer and using a window.

Motion by McLean to open the application for discussion. Second by Bridge.

April 13, 2017 minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

Commissioner Jordahl stated that she is more concerned about the compatibility of the vinyl siding then the gable.

Commissioner Weidner agrees, and asked him if he has thought about salvaging the siding for reuse.

Jake Boehm stated that they are salvaging 100% to donate due to deterioration.

Commissioner Battoglia agrees with the staff report that there should be a hip-roof facing the street and you could use a gable facing the rear for storage.

Commissioner McLean stated that he would like to see a hip roof on all four sides, and you could use dormers.

- D. **HPC 2017-22: 1009 Thomas Street (Knapp)** – Certificate of Appropriateness to replace a one-story front porch (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*) Property owner Gayle Knapp and contractor Mark Halperin were present.

Planner Kaarre provided the staff report. The house at 1009 Thomas Street is a Contributing Resource within the Historic District. The house was constructed c. 1905 according to the 2007 Wright District Expansion Survey and is designed in the Prairie style. The house may actually date to c. 1900-1901 as there is no original permit on file. The proposal was to replace much of the porch, but the contractor informed staff prior to the meeting that they may repair the railings.

Motion by Weidner to open the application for discussion. Second by McLean.

Commissioner Battoglia asked if the porch was original.

The Commission discussed the porch and garage design and timeline. There are no Sanborn maps.

Chair Payne stated that the house has nice character and details, which would be hard to replicate. The railing details fell away until after World War II.

Mark Halperin stated that the treads were 12"x12 ½".

Motion by Weidner to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness at 1009 Thomas Street as submitted pending staff approval of the post and railing details. Second by McLean.

Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, McLean, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

- E. **National Trust Preservation Funds Grant: Forward a request to the Village Board to apply for a grant to update the Guide to Oak Park's Frank Lloyd Wright and Prairie School Historic District**

Motion by Houze to forward a request to the Village Board to apply for a grant to update the Guide to Oak Park's Frank Lloyd Wright and Prairie School Historic District. Second by Battoglia. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, McLean, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

F. **Architectural Review Guidelines:** Discussion of proposed new guidelines

Chair Payne stated that they will continue the discussion at the next Architectural Review Committee meeting. They still need to finalize the Preamble/Introduction. Planner Kaarre provided them with a final draft of the Definitions section.

CONSENT AGENDA

None

OTHER BUSINESS

I-290 Eisenhower Expressway – Section 106 Effects Assessment Report: Planner Kaarre provided an update on this report. He attended a meeting on April 11. The report was prepared by WSP Parsons Brinckerhoff. Of the 8 properties in Oak Park along the I-290 that were identified as Historic (listed in the National Register or eligible for listing in the National Register), the project was considered to have either “No Effect” or “No Adverse Effect” on any of them.

Project Updates: Staff provided updates on previously approved projects at 321 S. Grove Avenue and 518 N. Marion Street.

Commissioner Moroney: Chair Payne noted that it was Dan Moroney’s last meeting as he was recently elected as a Village Trustee. He thanked him for all of his work on the Commission.

Commissioner Gurski: Chair Payne introduced Darrick Gurski as a new commission member. The commission members all introduced themselves.

ADJOURN

Motion by Bridge to adjourn. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, McLean, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne

NAY: None

The meeting adjourned at 9:15 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner.