

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE
March 22, 2017 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers – Room 215, 7:30 pm

A. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Christopher Payne (Chair), Greg Battoglia, Laura Jordahl, Aleksandra Tadic,
Noel Weidner

ABSENT: None

STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner

B. MINUTES

*Motion by Jordahl to approve minutes of the February 22, 2017 meeting as submitted.
Second by Tadic. Motion approved 5-0.*

- A. **733 Lake Street (Scratch Kitchen)**: Discuss alterations to storefronts (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*)
Business owner Patrick O'Brien and contractor Mike Fleege were present.

Patrick O'Brien, owner of Scratch Kitchen, stated that they will not be touching the marble base, but will take out the window and build upon the base up to bar height and bring a garage door window down to a granite top. It will be sealed when closed and opened when weather permits. You will be able to sit inside and outside at the bar on stools. The restaurant will be open-air. The garage door will hang from the inside.

Mike Fleege stated that the exterior will be aluminum framing, dark bronze, with a granite counter top to match the base, which is granite. The garage door will top inside the bar. This is only the window with the divided lights to the east of the entry door.

Chair Payne asked how the door will meet the window frame.

Mike Fleege stated that it will be the same thickness as the framing, or 3 inches.

Chair Payne reviewed the Window Policy in the Architectural Review Guidelines. The existing windows and mullions are replacement windows – east and west of the entry door. The entry door and side lights, and the cove moldings on the east window are original to the 1937 storefront. These should be preserved and remain intact. The storefront matches the building across the street.

Commissioner Battoglia stated that the storefront design is not historic, but they are respecting the building and the historic materials by using the existing openings and not removing historic materials.

Planner Kaarre provided a history of the storefront, which was installed in 1937 in the Art Deco style by architect Samuel Bird, who also designed the one-story building across the street at 726-736 Lake/144-150 N. Oak Park in 1937 in the Art Deco style. The 733 Lake building was reviewed by IHPA previously and the various historic storefronts were required to remain. One was allowed to be restored to the original design.

Commissioner Weidner stated that he also supports the proposal since they are keeping the design within the existing opening.

- B. **1020 Superior Street (Pantazopoulos + Beckenhauer)**: Discuss future siding replacement on the house (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)
Architect Christopher Wollmuth was present.

Chris Wollmuth stated that they found out more about what was there historically. There is no siding under two areas of stucco they checked. There is lap siding on the garage, so they figure it probably matched the house. They propose replacing the stucco with LP Smart siding and use square shingles vs. round shingles.

Commissioner Weidner noted that the garage was constructed much later than the house.

Chris Wollmuth stated that there was no permit on file, but it was added later. The siding was a similar scale. He doesn't know when its from. They are taking their siding cues from the garage.

Commissioner Battaglia asked what the period of significance for the historic district is.

Planner Kaarre stated mid-nineteenth century through 1941.

Chair Payne stated that what's there underneath the stucco is historic. The Siding and Soffit Policy of the Architectural Review Guidelines is to repair and maintain historic siding, not change to something unknown.

Chris Wollmuth stated that he thought from the last meeting that there were more options.

Planner Kaarre noted that the committee recommended at the last meeting to investigate if the siding was still underneath the stucco and could be restored.

Chair Payne stated that it is not more expensive to do stucco or siding.

Commissioner Jordahl asked if it needed repair on all sides, because stucco can be a forgiving material.

Chris Wollmuth stated that it does need some repair on all sides.

Chair Payne noted that the use of stucco and the Craftsman look is a strong part of the heritage of the historic district. It is a reason for maintaining the house as a Craftsman.

Commissioner Battoglia stated that the intent of the stucco was to homogenize it. Could a compromise be to do all siding?

Chris Wollmuth stated that 15-20% of the stucco needs repair.

Planner Kaarre explained the Standard 4 of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, from the Architectural Review Guidelines, "*Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.*" The reasoning behind the Committee's recommendations for keeping the stucco are that the changes to the house have gained their own significance.

Going forward, recommendations are:

1. Repair or replace stucco
2. Prove that repair is technically infeasible

C. 109 S. Scoville Avenue (Daniel): Discuss demolishing roof and gables and rebuilding and new and larger roof and gables, removing chimney, replacing siding and windows (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*)
Property owner Nicole Daniel was present.

Nicole Daniel stated that she acquired the property from the bank. It has a new garage and sidewalk. It has peeling paint – there is an asbestos test upcoming. There is an interior winding stair to the third floor master suite, which looks 1980s. The height and width of the stair requires expansion of the joists, which would lose ceiling height. She asked the architect what to do to keep the character of the house but provide more room. They proposed to demolish the third floor and construct new gables with new windows and demolish the chimney which is not operable.

Commissioner Jordahl asked if the existing windows are original or replacement.

Nicole Daniel stated that she doesn't know. She will have to ask the contractor.

Chair Payne stated that she should take photos of the windows to show their condition and why they can't be repaired.

Commissioner Weidner stated that historic windows should be repaired and used with storm windows.

Planner Kaarre stated that he could provide an informational list of window repair contractors via email.

Chair Payne stated that the front façade should be maintained. The front gable is a character-defining feature, with the Palladian window. You could “pop-up” the rear for additional interior space.

Commissioner Battoglia stated that new dormers are not to be more than 50% of the roof area, per the Guidelines.

Chair Payne stated that they should propose a different design to keep the front the same and maybe enlarge the side with dormers. That should still allow for their interior program. The chimney seems utilitarian and could be removed. If replacement of wood windows is necessary, they should be wood or aluminum-clad wood or composite.

Next steps should look at addition changes, windows and sidings.

Other Business

Adjourn

Motion by Battoglia to adjourn. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 5-0.

Meeting adjourned at 9:10 p.m. Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner.