# Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE

October 5, 2016 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Room 215, 7:30 pm

#### A. Roll Call

PRESENT: Chair Chris Payne, Greg Battoglia, Laura Jordahl, Aleksandra Tadic

ABSENT: Regina Nally

STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner

## B. Minutes

Motion by Battoglia to approve the August 24, 2016 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 4-0.

C. <u>303 N. Grove Avenue (Gaudette)</u>: Demolish a one-story garage and construct a one-story garage (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)

Property owner Mary Eileen Gaudette was present

Planner Kaarre provided an overview of the project. The house and garage are on a corner.

Mary Eileen Gaudette stated that the foundation has been repaired and the window sills are rotted. They are proposing to go from an 18x20 garage to a 20x22 garage. They are proposing a gable roof for storage space. Although wider eaves would mimic the house design, they would also need to move the garage further into the yard to accomplish.

The Committee discussed repair vs. demolition with the owner, as well as compatibility with the house, which is partially clad in aluminum siding. They discussed roof pitch, materials, trim and evidence of demolition.

The Committee made the following recommendations:

- Provide as many photos as possible of the existing garage to show the evidence of structural deficiency, which is the reason for the demolition request vs. repair
- Provide a set of complete drawings that show plans, elevations, details and materials
- D. <u>323 S. Taylor Avenue (Kilavos)</u>: Replace four casement window openings with two doublehung window openings facing front porch (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*) Property owner Zoe Kilavos was present.

Zoe Kilavos stated that she wants to replace the casement windows with double-hung windows. They are frozen in place and don't close. They are 100 years old.

Commissioner Battoglia asked if she had considered repairing the front casement windows.

Commissioner Payne stated that the Guidelines require that the operation of the window be kept the same where visible from the street and that they be replaced in kind. Staff could approve them if they were replaced with casement windows. If you wish the HPC to vote on

the application, you should bring evidence of their disrepair. Staff can provide a list of window repair contractors.

The Committee made the following recommendations:

- ARC presented to the owner the guidelines paragraph / section pertaining to Window Replacement: Windows should operate in same manner, match in size, shape and glass configuration.
- Windows should be replaced w/same in kind.
- Proposal of casement windows vs. double hung (presented) would not trigger ARC review –
   Doug could just grant approval.
- ARC recommendation to the owner is to bring pricing for repair vs. replacement
- Doug provided a list of window repair contractors for owner's use
- E. <u>733 N. Kenilworth Avenue (Buoscio)</u>: Construct a one-story south side addition on a two-story house (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)

  Property owner Phil Buoscio was present.

Phil Buoscio provided an overview of his project to date. The setback is significant. He reviewed the material choices and trellis idea, as well as the site plan. The COA has been submitted.

Commissioner Payne stated that the addition is compatible in size, scale, setback, massing and character. The relationship with the house has been resolved. Materials has not been resolved but the stucco is not original.

Commissioner Battoglia stated that he has done a great job as the intent was to be different.

Commissioner Jordahl stated that she loves the front undulating bay.

Phil Buoscio stated that the glass window in the "bridge-hyphen" goes all the way down. He thanked the Committee for donating its time as volunteers. He believes his project is better after going through this review process.

F. <u>5 Elizabeth Court (Wilson):</u> Discuss options for expanding rear garage (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)

Property owner Robert Wilson was present.

Robert Wilson stated that there is an old one-car garage and a 1940 one-car garage addition. Together they are close to the size of a three-car garage, but there are only two stalls.

The Committee discussed option sfor preserving the east section while renovating the west section. They discussed whether the 1940 addition had been altered or its condition was such that it could be demolished.

Commissioner Payne noted that the original garage/barn is very visible and the addition is charming. He noted the options would be:

- Restoration/repair
- A tandem addition in front of the addition or a carport
- Keep the barn and tear down the 1940 addition and build a two-car garage addition compatible with what was there
- Tear down everything and build a new garage that is larger (doesn't recommend)
- G. <u>618 Forest Avenue (Czupryna):</u> Replace windows, siding, front porch repair, remove brick chimney (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)

  Property owners Mark and Gina Czupryna were present.

Mark Czupryna provided an overview of the condition of the siding and sheathing. There is 45% wood rot and lead paint removal is expensive. The engineered wood will match existing exactly. Windows are also matching, but they are only being replaced where they can't be repaired. The chimney is broken or in pieces in the attic and no longer serves a function. They would like to remove it altogether.

Commissioner Payne recommends that the ARC make a site visit to see the siding and window conditions in person. A visual inspection will be helpful to see the deterioration. Smartside or engineered siding is a wood composite.

The Committee made the following recommendations:

- ARC recommendation is to visit the site to assess the condition of siding and other elements such as windows. The visit was scheduled for Tuesday, October 11th, at 1:00 PM.
- Based on findings, homeowner will be notified so they can bring to HPC meeting the cost for window restoration vs. replacement. Windows will be replaced w/same in kind where needed.
- ARC recommended to include the engineered wood siding sample for HPC review.
- H. <u>835 N. Grove Avenue (Cultra):</u> Construct a two-story south side addition on a two-story frame house (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)

  Architect Lance Shulzi was present

Lance Shulzi reviewed the site plan and the changes he made, including reducing the additive details, reducing the width, matching the wood siding (they changed from Hardiboard).

Commissioner Battoglia noted that the front porch of the addition competes with the house and suggested it be eliminated or the triple sliding window or both. A house should have one front porch, not several.

Commissioner Payne noted that the relationship of opening sizes between the addition and house was not harmonious. The addition takes up the side yard.

Lance Shulzi stated that he is recommending to the owners that they remove the aluminum siding and repair the wood siding, but its up to them.

The Committee made the following recommendations:

- Remove the aluminum siding and repair the original wood siding.
- Remove the triple sliding windows from the front of the addition and redesign to prevent the addition from competing with the house
- Match the trim of the addition to that of the house

## I. Other Business

<u>Architectural Review Guidelines</u>: Commissioner Payne provided an overview of the remaining sections to complete and the proposed timeline.

#### **ADJOURN**

Motion by Tadic to adjourn. Second by Jordahl. Motion approved 4-0.

Meeting adjourned at 9:45 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner.