

**Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission**  
**May 12, 2016 Meeting Minutes**  
**Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers/Room 201, 7:30 pm**

**ROLL CALL**

**PRESENT:** Chair Rosanne McGrath, Laura Jordahl, Don McLean, Dan Moroney, Regina Nally, Gary Palese, Chris Payne, David Sokol  
**ABSENT:** Fred Brandstrader, Greg Battaglia, Rebecca Houze  
**STAFF:** Douglas Kaarre, Urban Planner/Historic Preservation

**AGENDA APPROVAL**

*Motion by Sokol to approve the meeting agenda as submitted. Second by Palese. Motion approved 8-0.*  
*AYE: Jordahl, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath*  
*NAY: None*

**NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

**MINUTES**

*Motion by Moroney to approve the minutes of the April 14, 2016 meeting as submitted. Second by McLean. Motion approved 8-0.*  
*AYE: Jordahl, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath*  
*NAY: None*

**REGULAR AGENDA**

- A. **HPC 2016-19: 424 N. Kenilworth Avenue (Bao): Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear second-floor addition (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**  
Architect Debra McQueen was present.

Planner Kaarre provided an overview of the application. The house at 424 N. Kenilworth is listed as a Contributing Resource within the Historic District. The Dutch Colonial Revival style house was constructed in 1905 by Harper & Butendorff for owner James L. Kellogg. A rear one-story addition was constructed in 2002 and designed by architect Frank Heitzman. The proposal is to construct a one-story, second-floor addition above the existing rear one-story addition that was constructed in 2002. The addition will be clad with wood shingles to match the existing house. As the addition involves some demolition, the project requires a Certificate of Appropriateness. The proposed addition will be clad with cedar shake siding to match the existing house. The addition will be constructed above the 2002 addition, which will delineate it from the original house. The addition will not remove any significant character-defining feature or historic materials or change the historic character of the building when viewed from the front. The proposed addition is compatible with the house. The proposed addition meets the Guidelines and staff is recommending approval as submitted.

*Motion by Payne to open the application for discussion. Second by Jordahl.*

Debra McQueen provided an overview of the proposal. They are matching the roof pitch and the materials.

The Commission discussed whether it was possible to place a window on the west elevation facing the street. Debra McQueen noted that they could consider it, though a fireplace takes up most of the room. Chair McGrath discussed the gable roof of the addition versus the gambrel roof of the house.

*Motion by Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 424 N. Kenilworth Avenue for the rear second floor addition based on plans dated April 18, 2016 prepared by Debra McQueen Architect as submitted. Second by Palese. Motion approved 8-0.*

*AYE: Jordahl, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath*

*NAY: None*

**B. HPC 2016-17: 800 Fair Oaks Avenue (Roberts): Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear two-story addition, demolish a one-story garage and construct a two-story garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**

Steve Ryniewicz, an architect representing the property owner, was present

Planner Kaarre provided an overview of the submittal. The house at 800 Fair Oaks is listed as a Contributing Resource within the Historic District. The Prairie School American Foursquare house was constructed in 1915 by Harper & Butendorff for owner Walter Reeves. The one-story garage was constructed in 1916 by contractor August Peterson for owner Walter Reeves. The garage was altered in 1954 to accommodate two cars and add a patio. A rear one-story porch has been enclosed in the past and may be original, due to the matching stone foundation. The house sits on the northeast corner of Fair Oaks Avenue and Thomas Street. The proposal is to construct a rear two-story addition which extends into the back yard and is set back from the south façade by two feet. The addition envelopes and incorporates the existing rear one-story wing. The addition will be flush with the north façade which is minimally visible from the street due to the angle of view and an evergreen tree. The addition will be clad with cedar shake siding and have a limestone base, aluminum-clad wood windows and wood trim to match the house.

The proposed addition will be clad with cedar shake siding and limestone base to match the existing house. The addition will be set back on the south elevation (it will not be visible on the north elevation) to delineate old from new. The addition will not remove any significant character-defining feature or historic materials or change the historic character of the building when viewed from the front. The existing garage has been altered outside the period of significance of the district and does not contribute to the district. The proposed new garage is compatible with the house. The proposed addition and garage meet the Guidelines and staff is recommending approval as submitted.

Steve Ryniewicz, Studio R Architecture, presented the proposal. He discussed the dormers on the garage being gable rather than hipped, and noted that they are reusing the garage door.

*Motion by Jordahl to open the application for discussion. Second by McLean.*

The Commission discussed the application. They agreed that the addition was very well done. There was a discussion regarding the garage roof pitch and dormer design and how it did not match the house, as well as how to keep the height as low as possible. They discussed alternatives. Mr. Ryniewicz noted that he had also been struggling with the garage roof.

Planner Kaarre reminded the Commission that their role is to determine if what has been submitted meets the Architectural Review Guidelines, not to redesign the garage so that it matches the house.

*Motion by Jordahl to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 800 Fair Oaks Avenue for a rear two-story addition, garage demolition and new two-story garage based on plans dated May 4, 2016 prepared by Studio R Architecture as submitted. Second by Sokol. Motion approved 8-0.*

*AYE: Jordahl, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath*

*NAY: None*

C. **Pella Steel Windows**: Presentation by Jim Mansueto of Pella Windows

Jim Mansueto, Corporate Development Manager, Pella Windows, presented their steel window product and discussed their dimensions and possible applications in historic properties. Their portfolio includes steel windows from Grabill Architectural Windows & Doors, which is part of the Pella Companies.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

**OTHER BUSINESS**

Architectural Review Guidelines and Window Replacements: The Commission needs to be more definitive on what the HPC is approving when approving a COA, whether the clad wood window is true-divided-light or simulated-divided-light. They need to be clear that snap-on muntins and muntins between the panes of glass are not allowed under any circumstances. In the revised Window section of the Guidelines they need to make sure it's clear what is allowed and what is not. Front windows should be retained and repaired. Applicants who want to replace windows need to provide more information on why they feel the need to replace and not repair. Provide alternative information about interior storm windows.

Commissioner Gary Palese: Tonight is Gary's last meeting after serving two 3-year terms on the commission. Chair McGrath stated that they are sorry to see him go. He was always making the point that preservation can be good for business and make economic sense. He noted that he will stay on the HPC Education Committee and work on a preservation and economics report for Oak Park.

**ADJOURN**

*Motion by Sokol to adjourn. Second by Palese. Motion approved 8-0.*

*AYE: Jordahl, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath*

*NAY: None*

The meeting adjourned at 8:40 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre, Urban Planner.