

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
February 11, 2016 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers/Room 201, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Rosanne McGrath, Greg Battoglia, Laura Jordahl, Don McLean, Regina Nally, Chris Payne, David Sokol
ABSENT: Fred Brandstrader, Dan Moroney, Vice Chair Gary Palese, Tony Quinn
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, Urban Planner/Historic Preservation

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Sokol to approve the meeting agenda as submitted. Second by McLean. Motion approved 7-0.
AYE: Battoglia, Jordahl, McLean, Nally, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath
NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

MINUTES

Motion by Payne to approve the minutes of the January 14, 2016 and January 27, 2016 meetings as submitted. Second by Battoglia. Motion approved 7-0.
AYE: Battoglia, Jordahl, McLean, Nally, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath
NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

- A. HPC 2015-72: 528 Forest Avenue : Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear two-story addition and replace a metal roof with asphalt shingles (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)**
Architect Lance Shalzi of Airoom was present.

Planner Kaarre provided an overview of the application. The house at 528 Forest Avenue is listed as a Contributing Resource within the Historic District. The frame house was constructed in 1897 by Mr. Becker. The scope of work meets the definition of demolition in the preservation ordinance, and therefore the project requires a Certificate of Appropriateness. The proposal involves a rear one-story frame addition, several new and altered window openings, a vent chimney, and replacement of the metal roof with asphalt shingles. There is no permit on file for when the metal roof was installed, but it is thought to be the 1920s. Staff does not recommend approval of the application as submitted as the proposed replacement materials .

Lance Shalzi, Airoom, noted that the existing metal roof is rolled seam and not standing seam. Rolled seam is too expensive for the owners to install a new one, and the existing roof can no longer be repaired. They are proposing asphalt shingles to match the front porch roof. He handed out numerous photos documenting the exterior condition of the roof and interior leakage.

Motion by McLean to open the application for discussion. Second by Battoglia.

The Commission discussed proposed replacement of the metal roof. Although there is no documentation on when the roof was constructed, there is also no documentation from the owners regarding contractor estimates. Various roof bids regarding repair, replacement in kind and replacement in asphalt shingles are necessary to make a decision.

February 11, 2016 minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

Lance Shalzi stated that the owner had told him it would cost \$120,000.

The Commission noted that the type of metal roof and how it was constructed is of less concern than its appearance from the street. It may be helpful to find out what was there before the metal roof. Investigate the attic sheathing for hints. Visit the Historical Society of Oak Park & River Forest to see if they have any historic photos.

Motion by Payne to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 528 Forest Avenue as the proposed addition, chimney, new window openings and alterations, partial new chimney and removal of two chimneys meet the Architectural Review Guidelines on the condition that the replacement of the metal roof be removed from the scope of work and brought back separately with additional documentation. Second by McLean. Motion approved 6-1.

AYE: Battoglia, Jordahl, McLean, Nally, Payne, Chair McGrath

NAY: Sokol

B. HPC 2016-02: 835 Columbian Avenue : Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear two-story addition, rebuild the front porch, repair stucco, replace wood windows and doors, and move garage door to face the alley (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)

Applicant Kamil Drezek was present.

Planner Kaarre provided an overview of the application. The house at 835 Columbian Avenue is listed as a Contributing Resource within the Historic District. The stucco house was constructed in 1920 in the Colonial Revival style by builder Walter F. Johnson. The scope of work meets the definition of demolition in the preservation ordinance, and therefore the project requires a Certificate of Appropriateness. The proposal involves a rear two-story stucco addition, repair existing stucco cladding, replacing all the windows with aluminum-clad wood SDL windows, rebuilding the front porch and walls flanking the door in a more appropriate design, and move the garage door from the east to the west side facing the alley.

Kamil Drezek, one of the applicants, noted that they will need to raise the height of the front porch roof slightly because it interferes with some window trim. They plan to leave the attic windows in place. All other replacement windows will be simulated divided light aluminum or vinyl-clad to match the existing muntin patterns.

Commissioner Payne noted that the windows do not seem too deteriorated to retain and repair. You may need to replace some parts, but overall they seem in good shape.

Kamil Drezek stated that they are also seeking greater energy efficiency and the house looks better when there are no storm windows.

The Commission discussed the front porch and the apparent alterations to it over the years. The proposed new porch is compatible with the Guidelines. It was suggested that the applicants put stucco in the front porch gable as well.

Motion by Battoglia to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 835 Columbian Avenue as submitted with the condition that stucco be added flanking the front door and in the front porch gable. Second by Sokol. Motion approved 6-1.

AYE: Battoglia, Jordahl, McLean, Nally, Sokol, Chair McGrath

NAY: Payne

February 11, 2016 minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

C. Commissioner Training: Update on NAPC training by Commissioner Payne

Commissioner Payne provided an overview of one session from his day-long workshop held in Geneva, Illinois on November 14, 2015. The workshop was provided by the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions (NAPC). He discussed the role of commissions as public servants, how change is inevitable and commissions are managing change, not stopping it. He discussed how commissions run a meeting, open discussions, public outreach, due process, consistency in approvals and not discussing items outside their purview.

CONSENT AGENDA

D. HPC 2007-52: 644 Madison Street (Essex Foley Family LLP): Preliminary determination of eligibility for Historic Landmark designation – request 1-year extension of consideration: Continued from February 12, 2015.

*Motion by Nally to approve the Consent Agenda as submitted. Second by Battaglia. Motion approved 7-0.
AYE: Battaglia, Jordahl, McLean, Nally, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath
NAY: None*

OTHER BUSINESS

Grants: The Commission was very impressed with what the NAPC workshop provided and discussed looking into grant applications to bring the workshop to Oak Park in the near future.

644 Madison Street: Several new commissioners questioned what the Consent Agenda item was for. After continuing the Historic Landmark designation for eight years, the Commission felt it was time to reach out and have discussions with the property owner.

Unity Temple Tour: Commissioner Nally is working with Berglund Construction, the contractor for Unity Temple, to arrange a walking tour of the building for the HPC and the Plan Commission for a future date if there is sufficient interest. The Commission agreed there was interest and Commissioner Nally will move forward with the plans.

Staff Approvals: January 2016 staff permit approval report

ADJOURN

*Motion by Sokol to adjourn. Second by McLean. Motion approved 7-0.
AYE: Battaglia, Jordahl, McLean, Nally, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath
NAY: None*

The meeting adjourned at 9:00 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre, Urban Planner.