

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
April 10, 2014 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Rosanne McGrath, Joerg Albrecht, Greg Battoglia, Garret Eakin, Frank Heitzman, Regina Nally, Drew Niermann, Gary Palese, Tom Sundling
ABSENT: Fred Brandstrader, Tony Quinn
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP – Urban Planner/Historic Preservation

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Heitzman to approve the meeting agenda as submitted. Second by Palese. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Niermann, Palese, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

MINUTES

Motion by Sundling to approve the March 13, 2014 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Palese. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Niermann, Palese, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Commissioner Albrecht arrived.

REGULAR AGENDA

A. Historic Landmark: Public Hearing for the Purcell-Yager House, 300 Forest Avenue (1893)

Chair McGrath opened the public hearing. She noted that owner consent was on file.

Motion by Heitzman to accept the nomination report for 300 Forest Avenue as the Findings of Fact under criteria (1), (3) (5) and (6). Second by Palese. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Niermann, Palese, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Planner Kaarre read the exhibits into the record. Exhibit A is the Historic Landmark Nomination Form and Exhibit B is the Historic Landmark Nomination Report.

There was no public testimony in support or opposition to the nomination. Commissioner Palese noted that it is a great example of a Victorian home and would make an excellent addition to their inventory of Historic Landmarks.

Motion by Albrecht to forward a Resolution and the Findings of Fact for 300 Forest Avenue to the Village Board of Trustees for approval. Second by Niermann. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Niermann, Palese, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Motion by Niermann to close the public hearing. Second by Battoglia. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Niermann, Palese, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Commissioner Battoglia arrived.

B. HPC 14-11: 741 Linden Avenue (Ferroli Land): Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of a garage and construction of a new garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)

Property owner Marge Ferroli Lane was present.

Planner Kaarre introduced the application. The Walter D. Herrick House was constructed in 1910-12 and was designed by architect Charles E. White, Jr. The house is a Contributing Resource within the historic district. The rear two-car stucco garage appears to be a Contributing Resource and is visible from both Linden and Thomas, though is considerably set back from the street. The proposal involves demolishing a two-car stucco garage and constructing a new two-car garage clad with fiber cement stucco board. The existing garage has significant structural issues and cannot be feasibly repaired. The proposed new garage will be located in the same location and will be compatible with the house. The garage will have a hipped roof, 18-inch eaves, and will be clad with fiber cement board with a stucco finish. As the garage will be set back significantly from the street, it will appear as stucco. The vertical joints will be subtle and can be filled in to give the exterior walls one continuous stucco look. This can be covered with paint and the joints feathered with silicone. The new garage will be compatible in style, size, material, roof profile and details with the house. Therefore, Staff is recommending approval of the COA application as the proposal meets the Guidelines.

Motion by Albrecht to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 741 Linden as submitted. Second by Palese.

The Commission discussed the accuracy of the documents submitted in terms of notes and dimensions. They also discussed the appearance of the proposed fiber cement stucco board and whether it will be compatible with the stucco house.

Motion was amended to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness pending final approval by the HPC Architectural Review Committee with the following conditions:

- *The new garage should match the roof pitch and eave depth of the existing garage.*
- *The new garage should match the appearance of the existing garage, and additional documentation should be submitted regarding the methods proposed to visually eliminate the vertical joints of the HardiePanel boards, as well as the proposed treatment of the corners (as the current garage has no corner boards). Provide close up photographs of existing completed projects using the proposed methods of joint and corner treatments.*
- *Provide a material sample so proposed texture can be accessed.*
- *Submit revised documentation providing accurate information of the proposed new garage, including a site plan, accurately drawn wall section, and elevations that include notes and materials.*
- *Include information on cost estimates for the HardiePanel board v. true stucco.*

Motion approved 8-1.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Niermann, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: Palese

C. HPC 14-12: 214 N. Lombard Avenue (214 N. Lombard LLC) – Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear two-story addition (Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District)

Property owners Laura Connelly and Mike Parker and architect Pat Magner were present.

April 10, 2014 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

Planner Kaarre introduced the application. The house was constructed by K. Petersen in 1915 for Howard Baker in the Prairie style and is a Contributing Resource within the Historic District. The proposed work includes constructing a rear two-story addition and making some window alterations. The proposed rear two-story addition will match the existing house in terms of style/character and materials (stucco cladding and aluminum-clad wood windows). It is located at the rear of the house, though it more than doubles the footprint of the existing house and exceeds the massing due to its greater width. The proposed addition will more than double the size and length of the existing historic house, without making clear distinctions on where the original house ends and the addition begins. Although the proposed design of this addition is compatible, the massing and setbacks alter the character by creating one long, rectangular building, where historically it was square. The project as submitted does not meet the New Addition Policy of the Guidelines. Therefore, Staff is not recommending approval of the COA application as submitted.

Architect Pat Magner submitted revised elevations at the meeting which create clear visual distinctions on the north elevation of the addition at the eave line, at the second floor, and the trim band.

The Commission reviewed the revised elevations prepared by Magner-Manalang Architects which were submitted at the meeting and determined that they meet the Guidelines.

Motion by Sundling to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for a rear two-story addition at 214 N. Lombard as revised at the meeting pending official submittal of these revised plans and elevations to Village Staff. Second by Nally. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Niermann, Palese, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

CONSENT AGENDA

OTHER BUSINESS

Final Meeting for Three Commissioners: Tonight is the final meeting for three commission members who have each completed serving two three-year terms. Many thanks are provided to Garret Eakin, Frank Heitzman and Drew Niermann for their dedicated service.

Architectural Review Guidelines: Planner Kaarre provided an update on the process.

Staff Approvals: Planner Kaarre provided a report on the 68 Staff permit approvals for March 2014.

ADJOURN

Motion by Battoglia to adjourn. Second by Palese. Motion approved: 9-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Niermann, Palese, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 8:40 p.m. Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre.

U:\CPD_Strategic\Community Planning\HISTORIC PRESERVATION\HPC Agendas and Minutes\2014\2014 Minutes\2014-04-10-historic-preservation-commission-minutes.docx