

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
October 10, 2013 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Rosanne McGrath, Joerg Albrecht, Greg Battoglia, Fred Brandstrader, Garret Eakin, Frank Heitzman, Drew Niermann, Tony Quinn, Tom Sundling
ABSENT: Regina Nally, Gary Palese
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP – Urban Planner/Historic Preservation

Chair McGrath introduced new commissioner Fred Brandstrader.

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Heitzman to approve the meeting agenda as submitted. Second by Niermann. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Brandstrader, Eakin, Heitzman, Niermann, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

MINUTES

Motion by Sundling to approve the September 12, 2013 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Eakin. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Brandstrader, Eakin, Heitzman, Niermann, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

Commissioners Albrecht and Quinn arrived.

- A. HPC 13-24: 702 N. Elmwood Avenue (Kiker) – Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear/side porch addition, three new dormers, new two-story bay (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District): forwarded from the Sept. 12 HPC and Sept. 25 ARC meetings**

Chair McGrath introduced the review procedures and thanked the applicants for their cooperation.

Planner Kaarre presented the Staff Report. The two-story stucco house was constructed in 1911 by L. R. Laughlin for C. B. Ford. The Prairie-influenced house is a Contributing Resource within the historic district. The house sits on the north east corner of Elmwood and Augusta. The scope of work meets the definition of demolition and will require a Certificate of Appropriateness. The HPC reviewed the application on September 12. At that meeting they took no action on the application and recommended alternatives to the design of the two-story bay and the south-facing dormer. The applicants met with the ARC on September 25 and submitted three alternatives for review. The ARC recommended reconsidering the need for the south dormer, and suggested ways to revise the two-story bay that would be more compatible with the scale and style of the building. The ARC was supportive of looking at a square or octagonal bay which is smaller in depth than the original submittal, which would also resolve how the porch and bay interact. They also requested more information on how the raising of the roof at the eave line will be accomplished.

In response to the ARC's recommendations, the applicants have submitted two new alternatives:

October 10, 2013 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

Option A: Removes the south-facing dormer and adds a smaller square bay with hip roof to match the slope of the roof on the house.

Option B: Retains the south dormer, but reduces it in size, and separates it from the smaller square bay, which has a slightly angled roof.

The rear porch addition, and the addition of the north and east dormers remains the same.

Staff Recommendation: The proposed project involves a number of additions which will provide additional indoor and outdoor space. The porch addition, dormers and bay are compatible architecturally and meet the Guidelines. The proposed new square bay (both Option A and Option B) is compatible with the character of the house and meets the Guidelines. Therefore, Staff is recommending approval of the COA application under either Option A or Option B, as the proposal meets the Guidelines.

Greg Sutton, Airoom Architects, stated that the attic does not currently meet code, and rebuilding the roof will not change the eave line or the roof pitch. There will be no change in appearance other than deeper eaves.

Commissioner Albrecht noted that the new square bay is much improved.

Mr. Sutton stated that the owner's preference is Option B, which includes the south dormer.

Derrick Kiker, property owner, stated that Option B looks better than Option A.

Chair McGrath disagreed, stating that Option A looks more in keeping with the style of the house.

Commissioner Battoglia asked how the ARC dealt with the new bay and the Guidelines.

Chair McGrath stated that the Guidelines allow additions, and the discussion was on what was the most compatible in terms of shape, appearance, etc. The problem is with the shallow roof slope on the house.

Commissioner Heitzman stated that Option A is the best solution for the bay.

Commissioner Eakin agreed, and noted that the roof sketch provided shows the wrong bay roof slope.

Commissioner Sundling noted they should keep the owner's preference in mind, as they want to utilize the attic space. Extending the eaves is a better option than raising the height of the roof.

Mr. Sutton stated that the eaves would extend out an additional 4 inches.

Commissioner Brandstrader stated that Option A is more compatible with the house. He could support the additional 4-inch extension of the eaves.

Commissioner Quinn asked about the height of the front and rear porches.

Mr. Sutton stated that the porch extension matches the height of the rear porch.

Chair McGrath conducted preliminary straw polls which resulted in support for the square bay, the roof changes, and Option A.

Motion by Brandstrader to approve Option A as submitted. Second by Niermann. Motion approved 9-0.

*AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Brandstrader, Eakin, Heitzman, Niermann, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath
NAY: None*

B. HPC 13-26: 517 N. Euclid Avenue (Nevin Hedlund) – Certificate of Appropriateness for garage demolition and new construction (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)

Planner Kaarre presented the Staff Report. The two-story frame house was constructed in 1898 for W. G. Adams and was designed by architect Henry Fiddelke. The Queen Anne style house is a Contributing Resource within the historic district. The two-car frame detached garage was constructed in 1928 and is visible from the street. The proposal is to demolish the existing two-car garage and construct a three-car garage in the same location which will be clad in wood siding to match the house, and will incorporate a dormer similar to the one on the front of the house. The existing garage, though constructed in 1928, has been altered, has serious foundation issues, and does not match the style of the house. The proposed new garage will be more compatible with the materials and appearance of the house. Therefore, Staff is recommending approval of the COA application as submitted as the proposal meets the Guidelines.

Nevin Hedlund, Architect, stated that they took significant elements from the house, and the garage will be compatible – matching materials and color.

Motion by Heitzman to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 517 N. Euclid Avenue as submitted. Second by Eakin.

The commission discussed the visual distinction of the new garage from the house, and agreed that several details, including the two-car garage door and Palladian window would infer new construction.

Motion approved 9-0.

*AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Brandstrader, Eakin, Heitzman, Niermann, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath
NAY: None*

C. National Register Nomination: Village Hall – Update on the nomination of Oak Park Village Hall to the National Register of Historic Places

Commissioner Heitzman, who prepared the nomination on behalf of the Village of Oak Park, provided an update on the nomination process. The first draft was submitted to the Illinois Historic Preservation Agency in July. He received comments back which recommended providing additional discussion about the social significance of the building and reasons for its location. They were fine with the arguments for architectural significance. He resubmitted the nomination with the requested changes and the tentative review date by the Illinois Historic Sites Advisory Committee is October 25.

Planner Kaarre stated that as a Certified Local Government, the Village has the opportunity to provide comment on the nomination.

Motion by Albrecht to support the nomination of Oak Park Village Hall to the National Register of Historic Places. Second by Battoglia. Motion approved 9-0.

*AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Brandstrader, Eakin, Heitzman, Niermann, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath
NAY: None*

OTHER BUSINESS

Liaison with the Building and Property Standards Department: Chair McGrath spoke with director Steve Witt about porch code amendments. She thinks there is value in representatives of the department and the HPC meeting to discuss and identify areas of concern. The department could handle procedural changes and the Building Code Advisory Committee could review code changes. Commissioner Heitzman met with them a few years ago regarding the International Existing Building Code, which were recently approved. Need to have larger staff meetings to cover all aspects of a project. Planner Kaarre noted that they currently do have inter-departmental staff meetings on larger projects.

Staff Approvals: Planner Kaarre provided a report on the 124 Staff permit reviews for September 2013.

ADJOURN

Motion by Albrecht to adjourn. Second by Battoglia. Motion approved: 9-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Brandstrader, Eakin, Heitzman, Niermann, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 8:30 p.m. Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre.

U:\CPD_Strategic\Community Planning\HISTORIC PRESERVATION\HPC Agendas and Minutes\2013\2013 Minutes\10-10-13 HPC Minutes.docx