

**Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission**  
**April 11, 2013 Meeting Minutes**  
**Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers/Room 201, 7:30 pm**

**ROLL CALL**

PRESENT: Chair Christina Morris, Joerg Albrecht, Greg Battoglia, Garret Eakin, Rosanne McGrath, Regina Nally, Gary Palese, Tony Quinn  
ABSENT: Frank Heitzman, Drew Niermann, Tom Sundling

**AGENDA APPROVAL**

*Motion by Palese to approve the Agenda as submitted. Second by Albrecht.*

*Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, McGrath, Nally, Palese, Quinn, Chair Morris*

*NAY: None*

**NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

**MINUTES**

*Motion by Nally to approve the March 14, 2013 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Palese.*

*Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, McGrath, Nally, Palese, Quinn, Chair Morris*

*NAY: None*

Commissioner Eakin arrived at the meeting.

**REGULAR AGENDA**

- A. **HPC 13-07: 1033 Superior Street (Zubkus) – Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> –story addition (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)**

*Motion by Albrecht to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 1033 Superior Street for a rear two-story addition as submitted. Second by McGrath.*

Planner Kaarre presented the Staff Report. The house is a Contributing Resource in the Historic District. The 2-1/2 story frame house was constructed in 1903 with Queen Anne influences for William Ruppert by builders Harper & Butendorff. The rear one-story addition was constructed in 2003 following approval by the HPC. The current proposal is to construct a rear two-story addition above the rear 1<sup>st</sup> floor addition on the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> floors. The project meets the definition of demolition and requires a Certificate of Appropriateness. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application as submitted as the project meets the New Addition Policy of the Architectural Review Guidelines.

Jim Vanderheyden, project architect, stated that he also designed the 2003 addition, and the proposed two-story addition is a natural continuation of that. It continues the planes and roof lines of the house and only alters the rear façade.

The Commission discussed the connection of the existing and new roof dormers. They also discussed the proposed differentiation between the existing house and the addition, which will be accomplished by the first floor eave lines of the rear addition, which will remain in place. A number of commissioners felt that there could be more differentiation, but ultimately the commission agreed that the project met the Guidelines.

*Motion approved 8-0.*

*AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Eakin, McGrath, Nally, Palese, Quinn, Chair Morris*

*NAY: None*

## **B. Historic Windows: Continued discussion of window preservation policies**

Chair Morris noted that Commissioner Heitzman presented the proposed Window policies to the Environment and Energy Commission at their April meeting, though they have not provided official support yet. Approximately ten years ago the HPC unofficially determined that replacement of historic windows did not meet the definition of demolition, and since that time permits for window replacement have fallen under the Advisory Review process, unless part of a COA project.

Commissioner McGrath noted that this interpretation that window replacement does not meet the definition of demolition is inconsistent with the HPC's interpretation of other types of replacement, such as historic siding and historic roofing.

Chair Morris suggested that if the HPC wished to change that interpretation so that replacement of historic windows will require a COA, that they do it at the same time that the new Window Guidelines are presented later this year. There was consensus of the HPC at the March 25 meeting that replacement of historic windows meets the definition of demolition and would require a COA, though replacement can still be approved if documented.

Commissioner McGrath noted that the proposed new Window Guidelines will be more stringent than they are currently. She felt the change would be more consistent with other COA projects where if window replacement was involved they were part of the COA. The HPC is not looking to be stricter, but to review replacements more closely and allow replacement when necessary.

Chair Morris agreed with others that most people will want to replace their windows. They need to clarify when replacement is valid. Some are of the opinion that repair should be required unless deterioration is severe.

Commissioner McGrath stated that they have the same issues reviewing replacement of slate roofs or cedar siding. Each project should be looked at individually.

Commissioner Nally agreed that they shouldn't be too rigid.

Planner Kaarre noted that the current Roofing, Siding and Window policies allow replacement if repair is "technically infeasible", which means the cost of repair exceeds the cost of alternatives that meet the Guidelines. However, the HPC is looking at removing this term from the Guidelines.

*Motion by Palese to approve the change in interpretation of the Window Guidelines that replacement of historic windows meets the definition of demolition and will require a Certificate of Appropriateness. Enforcement of the new policies will be phased in with the new Window Guidelines. Second by McGrath. Motion approved 8-0.*

*AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Eakin, McGrath, Nally, Palese, Quinn, Chair Morris*

*NAY: None*

Chair Morris suggested that the HPC review the remaining sections of the Guidelines not yet completed by the consultant and reformat them to fit the new format created by the Focus Group.

The Commission agreed that they should try to provide all remaining sections to the consultant in the new format as soon as possible.

**C. Historic Garages: Continued discussion of garage preservation policies**

This item was not discussed.

**OTHER BUSINESS**

Staff Approvals: Planner Kaarre provided a report on the 85 Staff permit reviews for February 2013.

**ADJOURN**

*Motion by Eakin to adjourn. Second by Palese. Motion approved: 8-0.*

*AYE: Albrecht, Battaglia, Eakin, McGrath, Nally, Palese, Quinn, Chair Morris*

*NAY: None*

Meeting adjourned at 9:30 p.m. Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre.

U:\CPD\_Strategic\Community Planning\HISTORIC PRESERVATION\HPC Agendas and Minutes\2013\2013 Minutes\04-11-13 HPC Minutes.docx