

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
February 14, 2013 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Room 201, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Christina Morris, Joerg Albrecht, Greg Battoglia, Garret Eakin, Drew Niermann, Gary Palese, Tony Quinn, Tom Sundling
ABSENT: Frank Heitzman, Rosanne McGrath, Regina Nally
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, Urban Planner

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Niermann to approve the Agenda as submitted. Second by Palese.

Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Eakin, Niermann, Palese, Quinn, Sundling, Chair Morris

NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

MINUTES

Motion by Palese to approve the January 10, 2013 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Niermann. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Eakin, Niermann, Palese, Quinn, Sundling, Chair Morris

NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

A. **Historic Landmark: Preliminary Determination of Eligibility for 209-211 S. Elmwood Avenue**

Motion by Eakin to approve the Preliminary Determination of Eligibility for Historic Landmark designation for 209-211 S. Elmwood Avenue under criteria 1, 3, 5 and 6 as submitted. Second by Palese.

Planner Kaarre noted that owner consent is on file. The owners were unable to attend the meeting. The Charlton H. Catlin Flats was constructed in 1905 and designed in the Prairie style by architect E. E. Roberts. The house was nominated under the following criteria for designation:

- (1) Significance as an example of the architectural, cultural, economic, historic or social development or heritage of the Village of Oak Park;
- (3) Identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the architectural, cultural, economic, historic or social heritage, or other aspect, of the Village of Oak Park;
- (5) Embodiment of those distinguishing characteristics of a significant architectural type, or style, or engineering specimen;
- (6) Identification as the work of a builder, designer, architect, craftsperson, engineer or landscape architect whose individual work is significant in the development of the Village of Oak Park.

Commissioner Sundling inquired about whether the existing aluminum siding on the side elevations would have any impact on the designation.

Chair Morris noted that the Commission forwards a recommendation to the Board for final approval.

Planner Kaarre noted that the Commission had discussed the issue at a previous meeting and felt that the restoration of the front façade was significant enough to warrant designation. The

designation report notes that the aluminum siding is not an important feature and will allow its removal in the future.

Chair Morris noted that the owners intent is to remove the siding and restore both side elevations in the future.

Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Eakin, Niermann, Palese, Quinn, Sundling, Chair Morris

NAY: None

B. HPC 13-01: 143 S. Elmwood Avenue (DiSomma) – Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear two-story addition (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*)

Chair Morris provided an overview of the process.

Planner Kaarre provided an overview of the staff report. The house is a Contributing Resource in the *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*. The 2-1/2 story frame house was constructed before 1896 in the Queen Anne style. The rear one-story addition was constructed around 1997, following a major fire in the house. The proposal is to remove the partial-width rear porch and construct a full-width, one-story rear porch with a partial-width second story screen porch. The addition is compatible with the size, scale, set-back, massing, material, and character of the building; will not remove significant character-defining features or historic material visible from the street; will be constructed on the rear façade; will not change the historic character of the building; and makes a visual distinction between old and new based on setbacks and roof heights. Staff recommends approval as the project meets the New Addition Policy of the Architectural Review Guidelines.

Motion by Albrecht to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 143 S. Elmwood Avenue for a rear two-story addition as submitted. Second by Battoglia.

Commissioner Eakin stated that the addition blends in beautifully with the house and is distinctive.

Commissioner Sundling asked if the screens will be removable.

Mike Kollman, Wexler/Kollman SmartHaus, the architect representing the property owner, stated that the screens are removable, and the porch will either be open or screened, but no storms.

Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Eakin, Niermann, Palese, Quinn, Sundling, Chair Morris

NAY: None

C. HPC 13-03: 847 Forest Avenue (Tune) – Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear two-story addition, window alterations and a rear deck (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)

Planner Kaarre provided an overview of the staff report. The house is a Contributing Resource in the *Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*. The two-story frame gable-front house was constructed in 1915. The house sits at the southwest corner of Forest and Division. The proposal is to remove the rear mudroom and construct a slightly larger rear one-story addition with a smaller second story addition and adjacent deck. Both the first and second floor additions will have gables facing the rear yard matching the pitch of the roof. Three window openings on the north and south facades will be altered. The proposed window changes respect the character of the building in

their size and location; the proposed new deck will be partially behind the proposed addition and behind an existing six-foot high wood fence; the addition is compatible with the size, scale, set-back, massing, material, and character of the building; will not remove significant character-defining features or historic material visible from the street; will be constructed on the rear façade; will not change the historic character of the building; and makes a visual distinction between old and new based on setbacks and roof heights. Staff recommends approval as the project meets the Window Policy, Porch Policy and New Addition Policy of the Architectural Review Guidelines.

Motion by Albrecht to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 847 Forest Avenue for a rear two-story addition, window alterations and rear deck as submitted. Second by Eakin.

Tim Eberline, Tom Bassett-Dilley Architect, representing the property owners, was present.

Commissioner Eakin stated that the project is a good example of how to finish a utilitarian house and that the modest addition does a good job of solving problems and creating an elegant addition.

Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Eakin, Niermann, Palese, Quinn, Sundling, Chair Morris

NAY: None

D. Historic Windows: Continued discussion of window preservation policies.

The commission agreed to hold a special meeting to continue this discussion. Staff will contact the commission with potential meeting dates.

E. Staff Approvals: Report on January 2013 Staff permit approvals

Planner Kaarre noted that starting this month he will be providing a monthly report which indicates which projects were approved by Staff for informational purposes. The report is generated by the Village's building permit system. The report provides the address, scope of work, and category for approval under the preservation ordinance (Action 1 – Interior work, Action 2 – Non-contributing resource, Action 3 – Not visible from the street, Action 4 – No change in materials, Action 5 – Restoration, Action 6 – No impact on the historic character, and Action 7 – under review by Staff or HPC).

Commissioner Albrecht noted that it helps the perception that Staff reviews and approves a majority of all permit applications. It should be posted on the web site.

Planner Kaarre noted that the Village may be moving towards posting all commission meeting packets on the web site in the future, similar to Board meeting packets.

Chair Morris noted that it should be cleared by legal staff prior to posting, or just post the numbers.

Commissioner Battoglia was concerned that it could lead to commission discussions trying to second-guess staff decisions.

Commissioner Palese stated that the detail helps the public know what Staff can review, and agrees it may help with public perception. It doesn't need to be a discussion item each month.

Commissioner Eakin stated it's a good idea to provide a list of all approved projects by Staff. It should also include what the HPC has approved.

Planner Kaarre noted that under the Action 7 category it will list the project being reviewed, why and whether Staff or HPC approved it, and when. The permit system does not allow a separate list of HPC reviews only.

OTHER BUSINESS

Fenwick High School Window Replacement: Chair Morris provided an update on the process. Fenwick has continued their investigations into repair versus replacement and have met with a restoration contractor. Commissioner Heitzman provided some further information. Fenwick has been very receptive and wonderful to work with, and they will schedule another meeting to hear restoration estimates.

Comprehensive Plan: A vision kick-off event will be held on February 20 at 7:30 p.m. at the Nineteenth Century Club. For additional information visit www.envisionoakpark.com.

Lake Street Streetscape Committee: Chair Morris provided an update on the project. She and Frank Heitzman sit on the committee, led by Lakota Group. The project will cover Lake Street between Harlem and Euclid. They are reviewing 4-5 options from minimal to grand, and will provide a recommendation in the next few months.

ADJOURN

Motion by Albrecht to adjourn. Second by Palese. Motion approved: 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battaglia, Eakin, Niermann, Palese, Quinn, Sundling, Chair Morris

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 8:15 p.m. Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre.

U:\CPD_Strategic\Community Planning\HISTORIC PRESERVATION\HPC Agendas and Minutes\2013\2013 Minutes\02-14-13 HPC Minutes.docx